

Justification and Salvation – contrasting Catholic and Reformers’ Teaching

For question/comment contact jfcatholic@gmail.com

updated on Feb 25, 2024

How does God justify us to enter heaven? “*How can a man be just before God?*” (Job 9:2). On this issue of justification, the Reformers broke away from the Catholic Church. Together with the authority of Scripture, they remain the main dividing and irreconcilable doctrines that divide Catholic Church and all Protestants (and all post Reformation) churches to this very day.

Catholic teachings on Justification were promulgated at sixth session of Council of Trent on 13 January 1547 to counter those of the Reformers. They are still binding to Catholics today and are part of the *Catechism of the Catholic Church* (or *Catechism* for short)¹, promulgated in 1992. The Catechism says that justification is the most excellent work of God’s love made manifest in Christ Jesus and granted by the Holy Spirit². Quoting from St. Augustine (354 – 430), then bishop of Hippo in North Africa, it further states that our justification is even greater than creation of heaven and earth.

Martin Luther (1483 – 1546), whose 95 theses on 31 October 1517 ignited Reformation, wrote that justification is chief doctrine³ and whoever falls from it is ignorant of God and is an idolater⁴. It is *the article upon which the church stands or fall*, a phrase often attributed to Luther, but it was not⁵. According to another Reformer, John Calvin (1509 – 1564), justification is the principal ground on which religion must be supported⁶.

In Scripture the word justification and corresponding verb “to justify” are related to and have something to do with the words: righteous, righteousness and justice.

English		Hebrew or Aramaic		
		word	pronunciation	Strong ⁷
righteous, right, just Gen. 6:9, Exod. 23:8, Deu. 32:4, Psa. 34:15, Pro. 17:15, Eze. 33:13 etc.	adjective	צַדִּיק	tsad-deek'	H6662
to justify Exod. 23:67, Deu. 25:1, Pro. 17:15, Isa. 45:25, Jer. 3:11, Eze. 16:51 etc.	verb	צַדֵּק	tsaw-dak'	H6663
righteousness, justice Lev. 19:15, Deu. 16:20, Job 8:3, Psa. 18:20, Isa. 11:4, Eze 3:20, Dan. 9:24, Zep. 2:3 etc.	noun	צֶדֶק	tseh'-dek	H6664

English		Hebrew or Aramaic		
		word	pronunciation	Strong
righteous acts, <i>charity, alms</i> Dan. 4:27	noun	הַקָּדָשׁ (Aramaic)	tsid-kaw'	H6665
righteous acts, <i>charity, alms</i> Gen. 15:6, 1 Sa. 26:23, Psa. 106:31, Pro. 12:28, Isa. 32:17, Jer. 9:24 etc.	noun	הַקָּדָשׁ	tsed-aw-kaw'	H6666

English		Greek		
		word	pronunciation	Strong
righteous judgment Rom. 2:5	noun	δικαιοκρισία	dik-ah-yok-ris-ee'-ah	G1341
righteous, right, just Mat. 25:46, Luk. 1:6, Jhn. 17:25, Rom. 3:10, Heb. 11:4, 1 Jo. 3:7 etc.	adjective	δίκαιος	dik'-ah-yos	G1342
righteousness Mat. 5:10, Jhn. 16:10, Rom. 1:17, 2 Cor. 5:21, 1 Jo. 3:7, Rev. 19:11 etc.	noun	δικαιοσύνη	dik-ah-yos-oo'-nay	G1343
to justify Mat. 12:37, Rom. 3:28, Gal. 2:16, Jas. 2:24, Tit. 3:7, etc.	verb	δικαιόω	dik-ah-yo'-o	G1344
righteous act, judicial decision Rom. 2:26, Heb. 9:1, Rev. 19:8, etc.	noun	δικαίωμα	dik-ah'-yo-mah	G1345
uprightly, righteously Luk. 23:41, 1 Co. 15:34, 1 Th. 2:10, Tit. 2:12, 1 Pe. 2:23	adverb	δικαίως	dik-ah'-yoce	G1346
justification Rom. 4:25, 5:18	noun	δικαίωσις	dik-ah'-yo-sis	G1347

The word righteousness has something to do with judgment. Judgment in Hebrew is *טִפְשָׁה*, (Strong H4941) and in Greek is *κρίσις* (Strong G2920). To judge in Hebrew is *טִפַּשׁ* (Strong H8201), while in Greek is *κρίνω* (Strong G2919). Scripture says in Psa. 9:8: “*he* [God] *judges* [טִפַּשׁ] *the world with righteousness* [הַקָּדָשׁ]”; and in Psa. 33:5: “*He* [God] *loves righteousness* [הַקָּדָשׁ] *and justice* [טִפְשָׁה]”. Pro. 21:3 says: “*To do righteousness* [הַקָּדָשׁ] *and justice* [טִפְשָׁה] *is more acceptable to the LORD than sacrifice*”. Jesus said in John 7:24: “*Do not judge* [κρίνω] *by appearances, but judge* [κρίνω] *with right* [δίκαιος] *judgment* [κρίσις]”. We will face judgment when we die⁸ as Scripture says in Heb. 9:27: “*And just as it is appointed for man to die once,*

and after that comes judgment [κρίσις]”. There will be last judgment at Christ’ second coming⁹ (Rev. 20:12). The outcome of God’s judgment is *life* (heaven) or *death* (hell).

Justification and salvation are related, though they are not the same. Salvation is being saved by God *from eternal death in hell* and *for being united with God*, i.e., becoming partakers of His divine nature (2 Pe. 1:4). Justification must come before salvation – how does God justify us to be saved? Both justification and salvation are the works of God. We can neither justify nor save ourselves because of our sins. “*Who can say, "I have made my heart pure; I am clean from my sin"?"* (Pro. 20:9). Scripture says the soul that sins shall die (Ezekiel 18:4, 20) and death is the wages of sin (Rom. 6:23). In Mat. 10:28 Jesus said: “*And do not fear those who kill the body but cannot kill the soul. Rather fear him who can destroy both soul and body in hell.*” Death of soul refers to hell.

The reason why we cannot avoid sinning is *Original Sin*, the first sin committed by Adam. According to Catechism Adam and Eve were created in original holiness and justice¹⁰, which were lost when they committed sin, eating the fruit of the tree of knowledge of good and evil (Gen. 2:17; 3:2-7) – known as *the Fall*. What they did is their personal sins but as their descendants we are affected by it - we were born *deprived* from original holiness and justice, as well as in *fallen nature* and we became *children of wrath* (Eph. 2:3). Fallen nature makes us inclined to sin, which the Catholic Church defines as *concupiscence*. *Therefore, just as sin came into the world through one man, and death through sin, and so death spread to all men because all sinned* (Rom. 5:12).

As consequence of Original Sin, without *grace* from God we can neither justify nor save ourselves. What is grace? Whatever we get from God that we do not deserve is grace. Mercy, on the other hand, is when God does not let us get something we deserve. Thus, we enter heaven by grace of God and by His mercy we do not go to hell. Catechism¹¹ defines grace as *favour, the free and undeserved help* that God gives us to respond to his call to become children of God, adoptive sons (Jhn. 1:12, Rom. 8:16), partakers of the divine nature (2 Pe. 1:4) and of eternal life (Jhn. 5:28-29).

“Therefore, as one trespass led to condemnation for all men, so one act of righteousness [δικαίωμα] leads to justification [δικαίωσις] and life for all men.” (Rom. 5:18). One trespass is what Adam did, that led to condemnation of *all men* through sin. God could simply forgive our sins because He is all powerful God, but that will be abuse of power and injustice. *Righteousness* (רְצִיָּוָה, Strong H6664) *and justice* (מִשְׁפָּט, Strong H4931) *are the foundation of your [God] throne* (Psa. 89:14). Therefore, to fulfil justice He *graciously* took the initiative to *reconcile* us back to Him through what Christ did. One act of righteousness that Christ did is shedding His Blood on the cross *to atone* our sins. The word *atonement* or *reconciliation* in Hebrew is כִּפּוּר (Strong

H3725)¹². Corresponding verb כָּפַר (Strong H3722), means “to atone” or “to purge” or “to reconcile/appease” (Gen. 32:20) or “to cover over” (Gen. 6:14). Christ’ atonement made forgiveness of sins possible and opened the door for justification and life for all men – “*without the shedding of blood there is no forgiveness of sins*” (Heb. 9:22) and “*Since, therefore, we have now been justified by his blood, much more shall we be saved by him from the wrath of God*” (Rom. 5:9). It was prefigured in the Old Testament in the yearly atonement made by the High Priest (Lev. 16). Once a year the High Priest offered the blood of *one* of two goats as *sin offering* to atone the sins *of all Israelites* (Lev. 16:15-17). In the New Testament Christ is the High Priest who offered His own Blood (Heb. 9:12-13) to atone the sins *of all men*. “*For as in Adam all die, so also in Christ shall all be made alive*” (1 Cor. 15:22).

How can sinful men be justified or find acceptance in the sight of righteous and holy God? During Reformation the dispute between the Catholic Church and the Reformers is on the meaning of the verb “to justify”. Does it mean *to make righteous*, as taught by the Catholic Church or does it mean *to declare to be righteous while remaining unrighteous*, as taught by the Reformers? Protestant scholars Schreiner, Geisler, and other Protestant sources¹³, admit that before Reformation, following St. Augustine, to justify was always understood to mean “to make righteous”. The late Reformed scholar Sproul blamed the use of Latin in the (Western) Catholic Church as the source of that understanding¹⁴. However, the Eastern Church, now known as Eastern Orthodox Church, continued using Greek and they do not agree with justification teaching of the Reformers as they declared in their 1672 Jerusalem synod¹⁵.

The Catholic Church

Justification is a *translation* from that state in which man is born a child of the first Adam, to the state of grace and of the adoption of the sons of God through the second Adam, Jesus Christ, our Saviour¹⁶.

Justification is by grace¹⁸ (Tit. 3:7) and is an *on-going process* that includes *faith* and *sanctification*¹⁹. Our Justification *begins*²⁰ when, *without any merit*²¹ from us, we accept the gift of faith.

The phrase "justified by faith" appears *four* times in New Testament (Rom. 3:28, 5:1, Gal. [2:16](#), [3:24](#)). New Testament was written in Greek and the one in Rom. [3:28](#) is in Greek passive *present* tense while the rest are in Greek passive *aorist* tense. Both tenses *do not* indicate once for all justification. If Scripture teaches faith-alone justification, then the Holy Spirit would inspire Paul to write the phrase "justified by faith" in Greek *passive perfect tense*. Present tense in Greek implies the action of the verb occurs, usually in present time; it could be an on-going action or not²⁴, while aorist tense indicates the action took place, usually in the past, without any information whether it is on-going or completed²⁵. In contrast Perfect tense in Greek implies the action of the verb, is completed in the past with continuing effect to the present²⁶. When Luther translated New Testament from Greek to German, he intentionally added the word "alone" in Rom. 3:28. He rhetorically and arrogantly defended what he did through his response²⁷.

The most cited verses to support faith-alone salvation is Eph. 2:8-9: "*For by grace you have been saved through faith. And this is not your own doing; it is the gift of God, not a result of works, so that no one may boast.*" In Catholic understanding "not result of works" refers to the works before we receive the gift of faith. We neither need to be good persons nor do something to deserve the gift of faith from God. The Catechism clause 2010 says: "*Since the initiative belongs to God in the order of grace, no one can merit the initial grace of forgiveness and justification, at the beginning of conversion.*" Scripture says God saves us or we are saved by grace *through faith* (Eph. 2:8) *and through sanctification* (2 Th. [2:13](#)). The word Sanctification is related to holiness. Heb. 12:14 says: "*Strive for peace with everyone, and for the holiness without which no one will see the Lord.*" Salvation, according to Scripture, is therefore a process as it includes faith and sanctification – and so is justification.

The Reformers

Justification is God's *judicial declaration* that the sinner is counted as just or righteous by virtue of the *imputation* of the righteousness of Christ¹⁷.

Justification is by grace (Tit. 3:7) and is *once for all*²² and is, therefore, by *faith alone* (*sola fide* in Latin). Sanctification comes after and is separated from Justification, but these two always come together²³.

To be sanctified means to be set apart by God (the Sanctifier) for His purpose. All believers of Christ are *saints*²⁸ or holy ones. Sanctification is the work of God (1 Th. 5:23), that is, in Catholic teaching His grace *moves and enables* us to *freely* do His sanctifying works. Paul wrote: “*work out your own salvation with fear and trembling, for it is God who works in you, both to will and to work for his good pleasure*” (Phl. 2:13-14). “*But by the grace of God I am what I am, and his grace toward me was not in vain. On the contrary, I worked harder than any of them, though it was not I, but the grace of God that is with me.* (1 Cor. 15:10). “*And we know that for those who love God all things *work together* [συνεργέω, Strong G4903] for good, for those who are called according to his purpose.” (Rom. 8:28).*

English		Greek		
		word	pronunciation	Strong
to set apart, to sanctify, to consecrate, to purify Mat. 6:9, Jhn. 17:17, 1 Co. 1:2, 1 Th. 5:23, Heb. 10:10, etc.	verb	ἀγιάζω	hag-ee-ad'-zo	G37
holiness, sanctification Rom. 6:19, 1 Th. 4:3, 7, 2 Th. 2:13, 1 Ti. 2:15, Heb. 12:14, 1 Pe. 1:2, etc.	noun	ἁγιασμός	hag-ee-as-mos	G38
holy, being set apart for God Heb. 9:1,2,3,8,12,24,25; 10:19; 13:11	adjective	ἅγιον	hag-ee-on	G39
saint, holy Mat. 1:18, Mar. 6:20, Luk. 1:49, Act. 9:13, Rom. 1:7, 2 Co. 13:13, Rev. 4:8; 5:8, etc.	adjective	ἅγιος	hag-ee-os	G40
holiness, sanctity Heb. 12:10	noun	ἁγιότης	hag-ee-ot'-ace	G41
holiness Rom. 1:4, 1 Co. 7:1, 1 Th. 3:13	noun	ἁγιωσύνη	hag-ee-o-soo'-nay	G42

Christ came *not* to abolish the law (of Moses) but to *fulfil* it (Mat. 5:17). In Rom. 13:8-10 and Gal. 5:14 Paul wrote that we fulfil the law by *loving one another*. Christ said in Luke 10:28 that if we love God and our neighbor *we will live*. According to 1 Jo. 4:20 we cannot love God before we *first* love one another. When Paul wrote we are *not* justified by *the works* of the law (Rom. 3:28, Gal. 3:10-12), in Catholic teaching, those works of the law refer to Jewish civic, ceremonial, and dietary laws.

Rom. 8:30 says: “*And those whom he predestined he [God] also called; and those whom he called he also justified; and those whom he justified he also glorified.*” Sanctification, being also the work of God (1 Th. 5:23), is not mentioned in Rom. 8:30, unless it is part of being justified, as taught by the Catholic Church. In 1 Co. 6:11 Paul placed “justified” after “sanctified”, indicating that we are justified *after* being sanctified. All verbs in Rom. 8:30 and 1 Co. 6:11 are in Greek aorist tense.

James 2:24 plainly denies justification by faith alone: “*You see that a person is justified by works and not by faith alone*”. The standard response to reconcile this verse with faith alone justification: Paul in Romans wrote about the *source* or *root* of justification, which is by faith alone while James wrote about the *fruit* or *outcome* of justification. This is often expressed in the phrase “*justification is by faith alone, but not by faith that is alone*”²⁹, or true faith must be accompanied by evidence, like repenting from *future* sins and good works. Turretin³⁰, Hodge³¹, MacArthur³², and Piper³³ wrote that while faith alone justifies, evidence of true faith is *necessary* for salvation. It is now known as *Lordship Salvation Gospel*. Not all Protestants agree with them, that is, they follow what is known as *Free Grace Gospel*³⁴. They are labeled as *antinomianism*³⁵ or *easy-believism* by followers of Lordship Salvation Gospel. In return they accuse followers of Lordship Salvation Gospel of *smuggling works* into faith-alone salvation. In a nutshell the differences between those two are shown in the following Table:

Lordship Salvation Gospel	Free Grace Gospel
Justification is by faith alone, but salvation is by faith that is <i>not</i> alone.	Both justification and salvation are by faith alone.
<i>True</i> faith will <i>inevitably</i> produce works of obedience ³⁶ .	Works of obedience are <i>not</i> condition for salvation.
Believers will continue sinning, but they will <i>persevere</i> to the end, that is, they will always repent ³⁷ . Faith and repentance <i>always come together</i> (inseparable) in <i>true</i> believer’s life ³⁸ .	Believers will continue sinning, but repentance is <i>not</i> condition for salvation ³⁹ . Yet believers are <i>accountable</i> for their sins. Their sins will determine their degrees of reward in heaven ⁴⁰ .

Luther, in his early years, would agree with the “gospel” of Free Grace. In his letter to *Philip Melancthon*⁴¹ on 1 August 1521 Luther wrote that no sin will be able to separate us from Christ *even if we fornicate and murder one thousand times a day*⁴². The reason, as we will see later, is Luther taught that through faith alone, all our sins (past, present, and even future sins) were

imputed on (counted on or credited to) Christ, whom God already punished for those sins on the cross. There is *no limit* of amount and type of sins imputable to Christ. Our salvation is therefore secured, regardless of what we do, or what we do not do after having faith, known as “*once saved always saved* (OSAS)”. In *Lectures on Galatians*, written in 1535, Luther wrote: “*sin is unable to frighten us or to make us doubt the grace of God that is in us*”⁴³. But he also stated that *faith without works is false and does not justify*⁴⁴ and only believers who *repent* have their sins *not* imputed on them⁴⁵, or repentance became condition for salvation. Then in 1536 he wrote that while faith alone justifies, works are necessary for salvation⁴⁶. In 1539 he wrote that those believers who persist in sinning believe in different Christ, and are damned⁴⁷, a stark contrast to what he wrote on 1 August 1521.

While both the Catholic Church and the Reformers teach that our justification is by grace, the Reformers also say it is by *grace alone*, in Latin *sola gratia*. The word alone was introduced to capture their belief on the role of our *free-will* (freedom, free-choice) in relation with grace in our salvation. Do we *freely* work together with grace in our salvation or does that grace work *alone*? The former is now known as *synergism* - prefix “syn” means “together” combined with Greek ergon (ἔργον, Strong G2041), that means “work”. Greek verb συνεργέω (Strong G4903) means “to work together”. The latter is now known as *monergism*, prefix “mono” means “single”. The Catholic Church follows synergism⁴⁸ and so do Protestants who follow *Arminianism*⁴⁹. Synergism is not to be confused with *semi-pelagianism*. In semi-pelagianism grace and free-will are two *mutually exclusive and independent agents* that work together - God provides grace but it is up to us to freely work together with it or not. In Synergism, on the other hand, our freedom is produced by and depends on grace⁵⁰. “*The human will does not obtain grace through its freedom, but rather freedom through grace*”, wrote Augustine⁵¹. The fact that Augustine taught synergism is shown in what he wrote: “*But God made you without you. You didn't, after all, give any consent to God making you. How were you to consent, if you didn't yet exist? So while he made you without you, he doesn't justify you without you. So he made you without your knowing it, he justifies you with your willing consent to it.*”⁵²

The Reformers, on the other hand, taught monergism. According to Luther our will is in captive/slave of the will of God *or* that of the devil⁵³. When God is in control, then we do good, but we will do evil if the devil is in control – and we cannot choose who controls us⁵⁴. Because our will is in captive our salvation is the work of God *alone* through His grace from start to end⁵⁵. Luther wrote: “*We are not masters of our actions, from beginning to end, but servants.*”⁵⁶ Calvin taught that, after the Fall, our will is free only in doing evil, and unless God sets us free (or regenerates us) through His grace *alone*, we cannot *freely* do good⁵⁷. After being regenerated by grace *alone* we can *freely* work together with grace, not only in accepting the gift of faith, but in doing good as well⁵⁸.

The Catholic Church Intrinsic Justification

Through (on-going) Justification, the righteousness of God through Christ is *infused* by the Holy Spirit in us.

Infusion implies that we are *made* righteous⁵⁹.

We do *not* become righteous by our own efforts, but our righteousness comes from God through Christ⁶¹ as Scripture says: *we are made righteous through Christ* (Rom. 5:19).

Scripture refers Noah, Daniel, Job (Eze. 14:14), Joseph (Mat. 1:19), Elizabeth and Zechariah (Luk. 1:6), Abel (Heb. 11:4) and Lot (2 Pe 2:7) as righteous persons (קִדְיִק, Strong H6662, δίκαιος, Strong G1342). The existence of righteous persons, without naming them is shown in Psa. 5:12, 34:15, Mat. 5:45, 1 Pe. 3:12 etc. They are *neither* righteous by their own effort *nor* perfectly/continuously sinless but are made righteous through Christ.

The image that precisely describes the Reformers' concept of imputation (available online) is the one that shows Christ putting His white robe (His righteousness) over a person who *is still wearing his dirty robe*. The dirty robe illustrates our sinful nature, before and even after becoming believers, and therefore we can never meet God's strict judgment. The only solution is having external righteousness of Christ (His white robe), accepted through faith alone, that makes us counted as righteous. When we die and stand before God's judgment (Heb. 9:27), instead of looking at our sins, God will look at Christ' perfect righteousness⁶³. In contrast Catholics believe we are made righteous by grace through Christ, through infusion of God's righteousness. Being made righteous implies a process and does *not* mean we stop sinning. We continue sinning and consequently lose our righteousness, but as we will see later, we will be made righteous again *if we, cooperating with grace, turn away from sin (repent) and do what is just and right*.

The Reformers Extrinsic Justification

Through (once for all) Justification, the righteousness of Christ is *imputed on* (counted on/credited to) us.

Imputation implies we are *declared* righteous based on external/alien righteousness of Christ - it does *not* make us righteous⁶⁰.

We need external righteousness of Christ imputed on us because it is *impossible* for us to be *perfectly* righteous⁶². Even believers continue sinning.

Scripture says in Rom. 3:10: "*None is righteous, no, not one*". Psa. 53:2-3 says: "*God looks down from heaven on the children of man to see if there are any who understand, who seek after God. They have all fallen away; together they have become corrupt; there is none who does good, not even one*"; and Psa. 143:2 says: "*Enter not into judgment with your servant, for no one living is righteous before you*".

Is being made righteous necessary for our salvation? Scripture says death is the wages of sin (Rom. 6:23) and the soul that sins shall die (Eze. 18:4). It is righteousness that delivers from death (Pro. 10:2, 11:4). *“Whoever is steadfast in righteousness will live”* (Pro. 11:19). *“In the path of righteousness is life, and in its pathway there is no death”* (Pro. 12:28). Jesus said in Mat. 25:46 that the righteous shall go to eternal life. Being (made) righteous is always the requirement for salvation of all men, whether they lived before or after the coming of Christ and whether they hear the Gospel or not. God is *not* under any obligation to save all men, but He is just (Psa. 33:5).

Protestants, on the other hand, generally say those who have no chance to hear the Gospel were also saved by faith, citing Gen. 15:6 as proof: *“And he [Abraham] believed the LORD, and he [God] counted it to him as righteousness.”* Hab. 2:4 says: *“the righteous (קִיָּאֵ, Strong H6662) shall live by his faith”*, cited by Paul in Rom. 1:17. But Eze. 33:12 says: *“the righteous (קִיָּאֵ, Strong H6662) shall not be able to live by his righteousness when he sins,”* or righteousness can be lost through sinning. While *faith is necessary for salvation of those who hear the Gospel and to whom God offers that gift of faith⁶⁴*, *God is the Savior of all men, especially those who believe* (1 Tim. 4:10) – salvation is not limited only to those who believe.

According to Scripture faith is *not* the only source of our righteousness. *Whoever practices righteousness is righteous, as he [Christ] is righteous* (1 Jo. 3:7). In Gen. 15:6 what was counted (Hebrew אֱמוּנָה, Strong H2803) to Abraham for righteousness is faith. But what was counted (the same אֱמוּנָה) for righteousness to Phinehas in Psalms 106:31 was not faith but what he did as described in verse 30 (in more detail in Num. 25:7-8). When Christ said that the righteous will go to eternal life (Mat. 25:46), their righteousness comes from what they did (Mat. 25:34-35). Ezek. 18:6-9 describes what a man must do to become righteous and consequently will live – all are them are acts of charity or obedience, except the one about not approaching a woman in her time of impurity (based on Lev. 15:19). The Hebrew word for righteousness (חֲסִדָּה, Strong H6666) also means *alms* or *acts of charity*. Synagogues and some Jewish homes have חֲסִדָּה boxes, where they can drop money for the poor. Pro. 19:17 says: *“Whoever is generous to the poor lends to the LORD, and he will repay him for his deed.”* It is *not* salvation by works – in Catholic teaching our ability to have faith and/or to practice righteousness, through both we are made righteous, comes from and is only possible by grace through Christ, as apart from Him we can do nothing (Jhn. 15:5). Canon 1 on the decrees on Justification of Trent Council says: *“If anyone saith, that man may be justified before God by his own works, whether done through the teaching of human nature, or that of the law, without the grace of God through Jesus Christ; let him be anathema [accursed, from Greek ἀνάθεμα, Strong G331].”*

“You therefore must be perfect, as your heavenly Father is perfect.” (Mat. 5:48). Does this verse say God demands perfect righteousness that only Christ can meet? But the verse does *not* say

“be righteous as your heavenly Father is righteous”. The word perfect in Mat. 5:48 is Greek τέλειος (tel'-i-os, Strong G5046), which means “brought to completion” or “mature”. James 1:4 says: “*And let steadfastness have its full effect (τέλειος), that you may be perfect (τέλειος) and complete, lacking in nothing.*” To know the context of verse 48, from Mat. 5:21 to 5:47 Jesus first cited from the Mosaic Law, followed by the phrase “but I say to you” and extended what the Law says and that is what He meant with “be perfect”. Scripture says in 1 Pe. 1:16: “*you shall be holy, for I [God] am holy*”, citing Lev. 11:45. But 1 Sam. 2:2 says: “*there is none holy like the LORD*”. But the Reformers did not teach imputed holiness if none of us can be as holy as God. Holiness is to be infused in us or we are made holy by God (1 Th. 5:23).

Isa. 64:6 says: “*We have all become like one who is unclean, and all our righteous deeds are like a polluted garment. We all fade like a leaf, and our iniquities, like the wind, take us away.*” Does this verse mean God will *not* look at our righteousness because it is like polluted garment to Him? In line with this verse Luther wrote: “*I said before that our righteousness is dung in the sight of God. Now if God chooses to adorn dung, he can do so. It does not hurt the sun, because it sends its rays into the sewer.*”⁶⁵ But Psa.11:7 says: “*For the LORD is righteous; he loves righteous deeds*”. Psa. 18:20 says: “*The LORD dealt with me according to my righteousness; according to the cleanness of my hands he rewarded me*”. Why would God love righteous deeds of the righteous and deal with them according to their righteousness, if that righteousness is like polluted garment (or dung, according to Luther) to Him? One should read the entire Isaiah 64 to see the context of verse 6. One verse before Isa. 64:6, Isa. 64:5 says: “*You [God] meet him who joyfully works righteousness, those who remember you in your ways. Behold, you were angry, and we sinned; in our sins we have been a long time, and shall we be saved?*”. If we sin, as verse 5 says, we cannot use our *past* righteousness to cover up that sin. Eze. 33:13 says: “*Though I say to the righteous that he shall surely live, yet if he trusts in his righteousness and does injustice, none of his righteous deeds shall be remembered, but in his injustice that he has done he shall die.*” It is sin that makes God ignore and see (past) righteousness as polluted garment. The next verse after verse 6, Isaiah 64:7 explains further: “*There is no one who calls upon your name, who rouses himself to take hold of you; for you have hidden your face from us and have made us melt in the hand of our iniquities.*”

In relation to salvation Catholics do talk about *merit*, including *treasury of merits of saints in heaven* – both always misunderstood by non-Catholics. When we work, we merit our salary – our salary is *not* a gift from our employer but something we deserve. The reason is our employer needs our skill, otherwise they won't hire us, and we need our salary to pay our bills. Unlike our employer, God does *not* need anything from us – He is able to do everything by Himself. In Catholic teaching God *freely* associate men with His *gracious* works of salvation⁶⁶. God even provides grace that enables us to do that works. He also *graciously* rewards us when enabled

and moved by that grace we *freely cooperate* (work together) to do good works. Thus, the reward of our good works or our merit is *gift* or *grace* from Him – It is *not* something we deserve like our salary. God, our Father, does reward us, His adopted children, for our good works (Proverbs 13:13, Psalms 18:20, 2 John 8, Revelation 22:12 etc.) and that reward even includes eternal life (Jhn 5:28-29, Rom. 2:6-7).

Because our merit comes from and is only possible by grace from God, we can merit *for ourselves* and *for others* another grace for our sanctification, and even for eternal life⁶⁷. For example, moved and enabled by grace, a person works as missionary and his missionary works merit grace of salvation for others. In Rom. 11:13-14 Paul wrote: *“Inasmuch then as I am an apostle to the Gentiles, I magnify my ministry in order somehow to make my fellow Jews jealous, and thus save some of them.”* Paul wrote to Timothy: *“Keep a close watch on yourself and on the teaching. Persist in this, for by so doing you will save both yourself and your hearers”* (1 Tim. 4:16). 1 Tim. 2:15 says about motherhood: *“Yet she will be saved through childbearing--if they continue in faith and love and holiness, with self-control.”* Scripture also mentions *treasury of merits* of the saints in heaven (Mat. 19:21, Mar. [10:21](#), Luk. [12:33](#), [18:22](#)) that comes from doing good works.

In contrast to Catholic teaching Luther wrote that our good works are *imperfect*, and *we commit venial* (non-deadly) *sin when we do good works*. To the believers, Christ righteousness will cover this imperfection⁶⁸. According to Calvin our good works are *polluted* and will not pass God judgment⁶⁹, echoed in what Reformed systematic theologian Berkhof wrote: *“Even the best works of believers are polluted by sin”*⁷⁰. This belief fits well with Reformers' sola fide justification: we enter heaven based *not* on anything we do (or not on our merit), but *only* on faith in what Christ did on the cross (or only on His merit), known in Latin as *solus Christus* (Christ alone). Luther wrote: *“The true God has never yet smiled upon a person for his charity or virtues, but only for the sake of Christ's merits”*⁷¹. Reformers' teaching that we sin when we do good works was condemned in Trent council.

- *If anyone saith, that, in every good work, the just sins venially at least, or-which is more intolerable still-mortally, and consequently deserves eternal punishments; and that for this cause only he is not damned, that God does not impute those works unto damnation; let him be anathema.*
- *If anyone saith, that the justified sins when he performs good works with a view to an eternal recompense; let him be anathema.*

Council of Trent: Canon 25 and 26 on the Decree on Justification

The Catholic Church

Through faith and sanctification, the righteousness of God is *infused* in us and makes us righteous. All our sins (past, present, and future) *must be forgiven or washed away*. *Justification includes remission of sins*⁷². Those sins are *neither* imputed on Christ *nor* infused in Him. Scripture denies double imputation in Eze. 18:20: *“The righteousness of the righteous shall be upon himself, and the wickedness of the wicked shall be upon himself.”*

We cannot become righteous and sinners at the same time – we must turn away from sin before accepting God’s righteousness⁷⁶. Eze. 33:12-13 says: *“the righteous shall not be able to live by his righteousness when he sins. Though I say to the righteous that he shall surely live, yet if he trusts in his righteousness and does injustice, none of his righteous deeds shall be remembered, but in his injustice that he has done he shall die.”*

We enter heaven based on what Christ did on the cross⁷⁹ *and* what He does in us, that is, transforming us from our unrighteous state to righteous one. The latter also comes through grace. In Catholic teaching there are *actual* grace and *sanctifying* grace⁸⁰. Sanctifying grace is given through Sacraments of the Church, the Body of Christ⁸¹. But God is *not* bound by His Sacraments⁸² - He can give sanctifying grace to any without them.

The Reformers Double Imputation

Through faith alone, the righteousness of Christ is *imputed on* (counted on/credited to) us, and all our sins (past, present, *and future*) are *imputed on* (counted on/credited to) Christ. It is known as *double imputation*⁷³, a *glorious* and *blessed exchange* according to Luther⁷⁴, a *wondrous exchange* according to Calvin⁷⁵. It is basically an identity exchange or swap – through faith alone we take Christ’s righteousness, as if It *were* ours, and He took our sins, as if they *were* His.

Christ’ righteousness does not become ours and our sins, while imputed on Him, do not become His⁷⁷. We are counted as righteous but remain sinners or unrighteous at the same time (in Latin *simul iustus et peccator*⁷⁸). Christ was counted as sinner while He remains sinless.

We enter heaven based only on what Christ did on the cross. *“Christ alone stands at the center of God’s eternal purposes, Christ alone is the object of our saving faith, and therefore Christ alone must stand at the very center of our theology.”*⁸³. *“In Rome’s view, Christ saves us in tandem with the intervening role of the church in infusing divine grace in us via the sacraments.”*⁸⁴

What Luther meant by imputing *all* our sins to Christ is: as if it *were* Christ who commit our sins while He remain sinless. In Luther's own words:

In the same way John the Baptist called Christ "the Lamb of God" (John 1:29). He is, of course, innocent, because He is the Lamb of God without spot or blemish. But because He bears the sins of the world, His innocence is pressed down with the sins and the guilt of the entire world. Whatever sins I, you, and all of us have committed or may commit in the future, they are as much Christ's own as if He Himself had committed them. In short, our sin must be Christ's own sin, or we shall perish eternally.

With gratitude and with a sure confidence, therefore, let us accept this doctrine, so sweet and so filled with comfort, which teaches that Christ became a curse for us, that is, a sinner worthy of the wrath of God; that He clothed Himself in our person, laid our sins upon His own shoulders, and said: "I have committed the sins that all men have committed."

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4*, 1535, Luther's Works, Vol. 26, page 278, 283 - 284

One verse always cited to support double imputation is 2 Cor. 5:21: *"For our sake he made him to be sin who knew no sin, so that in him we might become the righteousness of God."* However, the verse says we become the righteousness of God, while according to imputation we do not become righteous – we are counted as righteous based on external righteousness of Christ but we remain unrighteous. The verse also says Christ who knew no sin to be sin. In contrast imputation does not make Christ sin as the verse says.

To explain what 2 Cor. 5:21 means, in Hebrew the *same one* word (תָּטַח, Strong H2403) is used for both sin (Gen. 18:20, Exo. 34:9 etc.) and sin offering (Lev. 4:8, 16:3, 5 etc.). According to Leviticus 16 once a year the High Priest chose *one of two goats* as sin offering (or sin, תָּטַח) to atone the sins of *all* Israelites (Lev. 16:8-9). That goat was sacrificed, and its blood sprinkled on and before the *mercy seat*⁸⁵ (Lev. 16:15) and on the horns of the altar (Lev. 16:18). The sins of *all* Israelites were imputed on the *second goat*, which was not sacrificed but released in the wilderness as scapegoat⁸⁶ (Lev. 16:8, 21-22). In the New Covenant Christ is the High Priest (Heb. 4:14, 9:11) and He offered Himself as sin offering or sin (Heb. 9:12). While He died to atone our sins on the cross, our sins are not imputed on Him, just like the sins of all Israelites are not imputed on the first goat in Lev. 16:8-9. Therefore 2 Cor. 5:21 talks about the atonement of *sinless* Christ made on the cross where He became *sin* (sin offering) that enables us to become the righteousness of God as we become partakers of divine nature (2 Pe. 1:4).

Another verse also often cited to support imputation of our sins to Christ is Isaiah 53:6 that says: *"the LORD has laid on him the iniquity of us all."* The Hebrew verb "to lay" in this verse is פָּגַע

(Strong H6293) that means “to meet” (Exo. 5:20, 23:4 etc.) or “to reach” (Jos. 19:22). Different verb, *רָחַץ* (Strong H5564), also translated as “to lay”, is used Lev. 16:21: “*And Aaron shall lay [רָחַץ] both his hands on the head of the live goat, and confess over it all the iniquities of the people of Israel, and all their transgressions, all their sins. And he shall put them on the head of the goat and send it away into the wilderness by the hand of a man who is in readiness.*” Aaron did *not* do the same thing to the other goat (that prefigured Christ atonement) that was sacrificed (Lev. 16:7-9, 15).

1 Pe. 2:24 says: “*He himself bore our sins in his body on the tree, that we might die to sin and live to righteousness. By his wounds you have been healed.*” The Greek verb translated as “bore” is ἀναφέρω (Strong G399), which means “to bring up” or “to offer”, also used in Mat. 17:1, Mar. 9:2, Luk. 24:51, Heb. 7:27; 9:28; 13:15, Ja. 2:21, and 1 Pe. 2:5. Christ did die for our sins (1 Cor. 15:3) and became curse for us (Gal. 3:13), *without* our sins imputed on Him as if He were the one who commits those sins⁸⁷.

In the Old Testament while the Israelites had atonement of their sin every year (Lev. 16), they were still *required* to have forgiveness of their sins. They had *two* ways to get forgiveness of their sin. The first one is through offering sacrifice in the form of *sin offering* (Lev. 4) or *trespass offering* (Lev. 5, 6, 7). But they need to go to (Jerusalem) Temple or Tent of Meeting (during Exodus) as they need mediation of *Levitical priests*. The second way is stated in Eze. 33:14-16:

Again, though I say to the wicked, ‘You shall surely die,’ yet if he turns from his sin and does what is just (מִשְׁפָּט, Strong H4941) and right (צְדָקָה, Strong H6666), if the wicked restores the pledge, gives back what he has taken by robbery, and walks in the statutes of life, not doing injustice, he shall surely live; he shall not die. None of the sins that he has committed shall be remembered against him. He has done what is just (מִשְׁפָּט, Strong H4941) and right (צְדָקָה, Strong H6666); he shall surely live.

Even in the Old Testament, the latter was more acceptable as it is written in Pro. 21:3: “*To do righteousness [צְדָקָה] and justice [מִשְׁפָּט] is more acceptable to the LORD than sacrifice*”. In the New Testament Christ abolished all sacrifices in the Temple (Heb. 10:8-9) – they are replaced by His *once for all* sacrifice on the cross (Heb. 9:12, 26). We are not required and are also not able to offer sin offering or trespass offering to have our sins forgiven. The Temple was destroyed in 70 A.D., ending the sacrificial system of Old Testament Levitical priests. This does *not* mean Levitical priesthood was also discontinued. It is an *everlasting priesthood* according to Exo. 40:15 and Isaiah 66:21 prophesied that God would take as priests and levites from all the nations, or they no longer must be Jewish. While Temple sacrifice was abolished, we still have the forgiveness of sins through turning from sin and doing what is just and right. Christ gave the

authority to forgive or to retain sins to His disciples (Jhn. 20:22-23), which they delegated to their successors, (Levitical) priests of the New Covenant⁸⁸.

Verses also often used to support imputation is Psalms 32:1-2, cited by Paul in Rom. 4:7-8, that says: *"Blessed is the one whose transgression is forgiven, whose sin is covered. Blessed is the man against whom the LORD counts (חָשַׁב, Strong H2803, as in Gen. 15:6) no iniquity, and in whose spirit there is no deceit."* But verse 7 does *not* say sin is covered by alien righteousness – that will contradict Eze. 33:13. Verse 8 does *not* say the iniquity is counted on Christ either. Scripture cannot contradict itself – what those two verses say are in line with what Eze. 33:16 says when a person turns from sin and does what is right and just: *"None of the sins that he has committed shall be remembered against him"*. Isa. 61:10 says: *"I will greatly rejoice in the LORD; my soul shall exult in my God, for he has clothed me with the garments of salvation; he has covered me with the robe of righteousness."* But this verse does not say the person keeps his unrighteousness under that robe of righteousness. Our righteousness does come from God, through infusion it becomes ours; Rev. 19:8 says: *"it was granted her [the Church] to clothe herself with fine linen, bright and pure"--for the fine linen is the righteous deeds of the saints."*

According to Scripture our salvation is affected by our future sins. Heb. 10:26-27 says: *"For if we go on sinning deliberately after receiving the knowledge of the truth, there no longer remains a sacrifice for sins, but a fearful expectation of judgment, and a fury of fire that will consume the adversaries."* "We" in Heb. 10:26 is first person plural that even includes the person who wrote Hebrews. If future sins will not affect our salvation, then James 1:15 would not warn us that *fully grown sin brings forth death*. It does not refer to physical death as some may claim – nobody drops dead after committing full-grown sin and those who do not will not live longer either. Both righteousness and wickedness have nothing to do with longevity.

"In my vain life I have seen everything. There is a righteous man who perishes in his righteousness, and there is a wicked man who prolongs his life in his evildoing. Be not overly righteous, and do not make yourself too wise. Why should you destroy yourself? Be not overly wicked, neither be a fool. Why should you die before your time?"

Ecc. 7:15-17

According to 1 Jo. 5:16-17 there are deadly (or mortal) and non-deadly (or venial) sins. We commit deadly sin when we break any of the Commandments *with full knowledge and full consent*⁸⁹. Christ said in Luk. 10:28: *"do this [the Commandments], and you will live"*. The Commandments are to love God with all our hearts, with all our soul, with all our strength and with all our mind and to love our neighbor as ourselves (Luk. 10:27). Luther interpreted 1 Jo. 5:16-17 to mean believers commit non-deadly sins and those sins will be imputed on Christ. The

same sins become deadly sins to non-believers⁹⁰. According to Calvin on the same verses, God does not give death to those He restored to life⁹¹ or they would not commit deadly sins. Sproul wrote that mortal and venial sins are teaching of Rome (the Catholic Church)⁹². Certainly, he was aware of what 1 Jo. 5:16-17 says but for reason best known to him (and he took it with him to his grave) he did not mention those verses.

Believers will continue sinning because they still have inclination to sin or *concupiscence*. But God does *not* demand perfect continuous righteousness. Being righteous is *not* being sinless continuously through-out our life on earth as stated in the Eze. 33:13-16. Pro. 24:16 says: “*for the righteous falls seven times and rises again*” and Ecc. 7:20 says: “*Surely there is not a righteous man on earth who does good and never sins.*” Neither do we need to accumulate sufficient “points” from doing righteous acts to cancel those coming from committing sin, nor does God keep track record of all our sins. Based on Eze. 33:13-16 Catholics believe: (1) whenever *we sin, all our past righteous deeds will be forgotten*, and we will die; and (2) whenever we sin, grace from God will move and enable us to *turn from sin* (or repent) and *to do what is right and just. Our past sins will be forgotten, and we will live or regain our righteous state back.*

When the Israelites were about to enter the Promised Land, they rebelled and demanded to go back to Egypt (Num. 14:1-4). God was about to destroy them (Num. 14:11-12) but Moses interceded for them (Num. 14:13-19); and they were forgiven (Num. 14:20). But God still punished those who rebel by not allowing them to enter the Promised Land, save Joshua and Caleb, and by making their children wander in the desert for forty years (Num. 14:21-35). In 2 Sam. 12:13-14 David asked forgiveness of his sin of adultery and murder; and God did forgive him, but his punishment was the death of his child with Bathsheba. To conclude sin, even after being forgiven, still carries *punishment*. In Catholic teaching there are *eternal* and *temporal* punishments⁹³, corresponding to deadly (mortal) and non-deadly (venial) sins of 1 Jo. 5:16-17. Eternal punishment means eternal death in hell. The punishment of deadly sin is both eternal and temporal, while that of non-deadly sin is temporal. If we repent from deadly sin, God *graciously* cancel the eternal punishment, but its temporal punishment remains⁹⁴. Temporal punishment also remains after repenting from non-deadly sin. “*Doing what is just* (טַפְּחֵן, Strong H4941) *and right* (יִצְדִּיקָה, Strong H6666)” in Eze. 33:14-16, which a sinner must do after turning from sin, corresponds to this temporal punishment. They may come in the form of acts of charity, alms (יִצְדִּיקָה, Strong H6666), fasting, prayer, and other forms of penance. To Protestants such things violate *solus Christus* as they “add” what Christ already accomplished on the cross - He was already punished for *all* our sins, being imputed on Him. For the same reason they also have problem with Catholic beliefs on *indulgences* and *purgatory*.

An indulgence is a *remission*⁹⁵ of *temporal* punishment of *already forgiven* (deadly or non-deadly) sins⁹⁶. It can be applied to oneself or to those in purgatory and is obtained through the Church from the *treasury of the merits of Christ and of all saints in heaven*⁹⁷. That of the saints comes from grace enabled good works (Mat. 19:21, Mar. [10:21](#), Luk. [12:33](#), [18:22](#)). Scripture is silent on the purpose of saints' treasure of merit in heaven. Non-Catholics may disagree on how the Catholic Church makes use of that treasure, but they should not turn blind eye on it. That merits are *imputed* through indulgences. Unlike righteousness and wickedness that are *not* imputable to others (Eze. 18:20), merit (or demerit) can be imputed to others. In Gen. [18:32](#) God told Abraham that He would not destroy Sodom and Gomorrah if there were ten righteous persons living there. How many they had? According to 2 Pe. 2:7 Lot was righteous person – they had one, but one is less than ten. Suppose there were ten of them, then God would not destroy those cities. Another example is in when God told Solomon, after he worshipped other gods (1 Ki. 11:4-8), that He would not tear his kingdom during his lifetime because of what his father (David) did (1 Ki. 11:12).

The English word “Sacrament” comes from Latin “*Sacramentum*”, which is translation of the Greek *μυστήριον* (Strong G3466). In New Testament the word appears in Mat. 13:11, Rom. 16:25, 1 Cor. 4:1 etc., and it means something that is revealed from a previously hidden truth. The classic definition of sacrament is *the visible form of invisible grace*, that came from St. Augustine of Hippo⁹⁸. Using our five senses we cannot detect grace and therefore through sacraments it becomes visible to us. While Sacraments have their basis in the Scripture, the concept of sacraments developed over time. The Catholic Church, together with *Eastern Orthodox Church*, *Oriental Orthodox Church*, and the *(Assyrian) Orthodox Church of the East*, recognizes *seven* Sacraments. They are *Baptism*, *Confirmation*, *Eucharist*, *Penance*, *Extreme unction* or *Anointing of the Sick*, *Holy Order* and *Matrimony*. In 1519 Luther still accepted three sacraments when he wrote *The Sacrament of Penance, the Holy and Blessed Sacrament of Baptism and the Blessed Sacrament of the Holy and True Body of Christ and the Brotherhoods*. One year later, he wrote *The Babylonian Captivity of the Church* where he accepted only Baptism and Eucharist. Following Luther, some Protestant churches recognize only those two sacraments. Others believe that Baptism is only public declaration of faith in Christ (nowhere stated in Scripture) while the Eucharist, or mostly known as Lord's Supper, if they still practise it, is only memorial meal. Both are usually referred as *ordinances*; they have nothing to do with grace or they are no longer sacraments and are *not* required for salvation.

In Catholic teaching Justification is *conferred* in Baptism⁹⁹. It is necessary for salvation (Mark 16:16; John 3:5; 1 Peter 3:21) of *those who hear the Gospel and have the chance to take it*¹⁰⁰. Baptism is sacrament of *regeneration* (Titus 3:5), that is, through Baptism we are *born-again* (John 3:3,5) as sons of God¹⁰¹. Rom. 6:3-4 says: “*We were buried therefore with Him by baptism*

into death, so that as Christ was raised from the dead by the glory of the Father, we too might walk in newness of life.” Luther believed in Baptism of Regeneration and through Baptism we are born again¹⁰². He taught that Baptism is necessary for salvation¹⁰³. Calvin also related Titus 3:5 to Baptism of Regeneration¹⁰⁴. To many Evangelicals, we are *born-again* after we sincerely say the *sinner’s prayer*, through which we: **A**cknowledge our sinfulness; **B**elieve in Christ as personal Lord and Saviour; and **C**onfess that He died on the cross for our sins.

Catholics believe through Baptism all past sins (Acts 2:38, 22:16) and their punishment (eternal and temporal)¹⁰⁵, as well as *guilt* of Original Sin are forgiven, and we receive grace of justification or *sanctifying* (or *deifying*) grace¹⁰⁶. While the guilt of Original Sin is removed, concupiscence (inclination to sin), however, remains with us. According to Luther Baptism erases past sins¹⁰⁷. Calvin, on the other hand, wrote that through Baptism both past and *future* sins are forgiven¹⁰⁸. Both Luther¹⁰⁹ and Calvin¹¹⁰ denied that Baptism erases Original Sin, that is, they taught it remains with believers after baptism, but no longer imputed on them¹¹¹.

The Catechism says that through (Sacrament of) Baptism we receive *sanctifying* or *deifying* grace¹¹² for the first time – it is the grace that makes us righteous and partakers of His Divinity (2 Peter 1:4) and therefore entitles us to go to heaven. It is distinguished from *actual* grace, which is the grace from God that moves and enables us to *freely* believe in Christ, to obey His commandments and to repent. We lose our righteous state (our sanctifying grace) when we commit deadly sin (Eze. 33:13, 1 Jo. 5:16-17). Moved and enabled by *actual* grace we repent and regain our righteous state (sanctifying grace) back through Sacrament of Penance.

Was one of the thieves on the cross saved without baptism (Luk. 23:40-43)? This case is always raised to deny the necessity of Baptism in salvation. In Catholic teaching Baptism is *necessary for those who heard the Gospel and have chance to take it*. He, being on the cross, had no chance to take it and he died shortly after having faith in Christ, or he had no chance to commit any sin that made him lose righteousness (Eze. 33:12-13).

Dying with even *just one* un-repented deadly sin makes that sinner go to hell. What happens if one dies still with some non-deadly (venial) sins *and/or* temporal punishment. The person must undergo purification through *purgatory*¹¹³ as nothing unclean can enter heaven (Rev. 21:27). Scripture refers God as *refiner’s fire and fuller’s soap* (Mal. 3:2) – both have something to do with refining and cleansing. Zec. 13:8-9 says God put *some* into fire as one refines silver and test gold - the word purgatory is not mentioned but the concept is. To Protestants purgatory makes what Christ did on the cross insufficient – He was already punished for *all* our sins imputed on Him. On the cross He said in Jhn. 19:30: *“it is finished (accomplished)”*. But what He did accomplish was His purpose to come down from heaven, that is, to become ransom for us (Mar. 10:45).

The Catholic Church

Christ *willingly* offered Himself to die on the cross to atone our sins (Mat. 20:28, Mark 10:45). God did *not* punish Him for our sins.

Christ died on the cross to atone sins of all men (Jo. 1:29, 2 Cor. 5:15, 1 Jo. 2:2)¹¹⁶.

The Reformers

Because *all* sins of believers are imputed on Christ, God directed His wrath to Christ¹¹⁴ and punished Him, instead of us¹¹⁵.

Only believers have their sins imputed on Christ. This leads to the belief that Christ did *not* die for all men¹¹⁷, known as *Limited Atonement*.

Since the word justification is related to judgment there is *forensic* aspect of justification. In human courtroom it will be considered *injustice* when a criminal was declared not guilty because his crimes were imputed or counted to an innocent person, who then was punished for the crimes he/she did not commit. Even if that innocent person, say his mother, was willing to bear the punishment because of her unconditional love, a human judge should not allow it to happen for the same reason – it was injustice to punish the mother for crimes committed by her son. Human courtroom is not perfect, and injustice did happen and will happen. But the same cannot be said about God's judgment in His heavenly courtroom. "*Righteousness* [יָדָיִץ, Strong H6664] *and justice* [צְדָקָה, Strong H4941] *are the foundation of your* [God] *throne* (Psa. 89:14).

We do continue sinning, even after becoming believers but *as long we are alive* God gives us the chance to receive forgiveness of sin through His grace that enables and moves us to repent. Once we repent God will no longer look at our sins (Eze. 33:14-16). This is *gracious* act of God as Scripture says: "*If you, O LORD, should mark iniquities, O Lord, who could stand?*" (Psa. 130:3). Scripture says we will be judged when we die (Heb. 9:27), which the Catholic Church refers as *particular* judgment¹¹⁸. If we die in righteous state or without any un-repentead deadly sin, then we will be also *legally declared* righteous because we are indeed *made* righteous by grace through Christ (Rom. 5:19). In contrast, according to the Reformers, when we die, we will be legally declared righteous based on external righteousness of Christ. Even if we always repent from our sins and have them forgiven (for those who follow Lordship Salvation Gospel) God will look at those (past) sins had they are *not* hidden under the perfect righteousness of Christ¹¹⁹. Those who follow Free Grace Gospel believe they still go to heaven even if they die with un-repentead sins. In both Lordship Salvation and Free Grace Gospels, God punished the sinless and righteous Christ for our sins on the cross, as *if he were the one who committed those sins*. This will make God do abomination according to what it is written in Pro. 17:15: "*He who justifies the wicked and he who condemns the righteous are both alike an abomination to the LORD.*"

End Notes

¹ [www.vatican.va/archive/ENG0015/ INDEX.HTM](http://www.vatican.va/archive/ENG0015/INDEX.HTM)

² Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1994

³ *Christ wants to concentrate our attention on this chief doctrine, our justification before God, in order that we may believe in Him.*

This article of justification is the chief doctrine.

Luther: *Sermons on the Gospel of St. John, 1530-1532*, Luther's Works, Vol. 23, page 109, 129

⁴ *Whoever falls from the doctrine of justification is ignorant of God and is an idolater.*

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4, 1535*, Luther's Works, Vol. 26, page 395

⁵ The phrase appears in the Introduction of Luther: *The Disputation Concerning Justification, 1536* and translated by Dr. Lewis William Spitz.

Though Luther was not a theological systematizer in the manner of Melancthon or Calvin, he recognized that all aspects of evangelical theology were related to the one article of faith by which the church stands or falls. That is why he said in the preface to this disputation, "As you have often heard, most excellent brothers, because that one article concerning justification even by itself creates true theologians, therefore it is indispensable in the church and just as we must often recall it, so we must frequently work on it."

Introduction to Luther: *the Dispute Concerning Justification, 1536*, Luther's Works, Vol. 34, page 147

Dr. Lewis William Spitz (1922 – 1999) was William R. Kenan Jr. Professor of History (Emeritus) at Stanford University, Palo Alto, California.

⁶ *The doctrine of Justification is now to be fully discussed, and discussed under the conviction, that as it is the principal ground on which religion must be supported.*

Calvin: *The Institutes of the Christian Religion, 3.11.1*, page 605

⁷ A *concordance* is index of every word (Hebrews, Aramaic, Greek) in the Bible and corresponding verses, where it appears – for Strong Concordance, verses of 66-book KJV (King James Version) English Bible. Strong Concordance was the work of James Strong (1822 - 1894) and was first published in 1890. Each word was given a number with prefix H (Hebrews or Aramaic) or G (Greek). James Strong was professor of exegetical theology (from 1868) at Drew Theological School, New Jersey, USA.

⁸ *Every man receives his eternal recompense in his immortal soul from the moment of his death in a particular judgment by Christ, the judge of the living and the dead.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1051

⁹ *The Last Judgment will come when Christ returns in glory.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1040

¹⁰ Catechism of the Catholic Church # 404

¹¹ Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1996

¹² In Greek New Testament different words are used to describe what Christ did on the cross, translated into English as atonement, or reconciliation, or atoning sacrifice, or propitiation, or expiation, or redemption or ransom:

- ἀντίλυτρον (an-til'-oo-tron, Strong G487): 1 Tim. 2:6
- ἀπολύτρωσις (ap-ol-oo'-tro-sis, Strong G629) Rom. 3:24, Eph. 1:7, Col. 1:14, Heb. 9:15
- ἱλασμός (hil-as-mos', Strong G2434): 1 Jo. 2:2, 4:10
- ἱλαστήριον (hil-as-tay'-ree-on, Strong G2435) Rom. 3:25, in Heb. 9:5 it is translated as mercy seat or place of atonement, which is the gold lid cover of the Ark of the Covenant.
- καταλλαγή (kat-al-lag-ay', Strong G2643): Rom. 5:11
- λύτρον (loo'-tron, Strong G3083): Mat. 20:28, Mar. 10:45

¹³ *Before we can understand discussions about justification during the Reformation, we should make a few observations about the medieval view of justification that was widely understood and accepted at the time. It is safe to say that Augustine's definition of justification had triumphed in the church. All understood justification to mean that believers are made righteous.*

Schreiner, T.R.: *Faith Alone – the Doctrine of Justification*, page 38

Thomas R. Schreiner (born 1954) is James Buchanan Harrison Professor of New Testament Interpretation and Professor of Biblical Theology and Associate Dean of the School of Theology of the Southern Baptist Theological Seminary.

*Before Luther, the standard Augustinian position on justification stressed **intrinsic justification**. Intrinsic justification argues that the believer is made righteous by God's grace, as compared to extrinsic justification, by which a sinner is forensically declared righteous.*

Geisler, N.L. and MacKenzie, R.E.: *Roman Catholics and Evangelicals: Agreements and Differences*, page 222
Norman L. Geisler (1932 – 2019) was Systematic Theologian and philosopher, cofounder of Veritas International University in California and Southern Evangelical Seminary in North Carolina, USA.

*Although Augustine had conceived this righteousness as **imparted** to sinners and **intrinsic** to their persons, Luther insists that it is an extrinsic righteousness, imputed to believers.*

Hillebrand, H.J., editor in chief: *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Reformation*, Vol. 2, page 363

*The importance of this biblical and doctrinal insight to both Lutheran and Calvinist forms of Protestantism can easily obscure the fact that the Reformation view of justification was not always the doctrinal view of the church and that **neither the early church nor the medieval church recognized the principle of justification sola fide**.*

McKim, D.K., editor: *Encyclopedia of the Reformed Faith*, page 201

- ¹⁴ *The early Latin fathers, who studied Scriptures by means of the Vulgate (the fourth-century Latin translation of the Bible) rather than the Septuagint (the Greek translation of the Old Testament) and the Greek New Testament, developed their doctrine of justification based on their understanding of the legal system of the Roman empire. In time, the doctrine of justification came to address the question of how an unrighteous person, a fallen sinner, can be made righteous.*

Sproul, R.C.: *Are We Together*, page 30

Robert Charles Sproul (1939 - 2017) was Reformed theologian and pastor, the founder of Ligonier Ministry.

- ¹⁵ *We believe a man to be not simply justified through faith alone, but through faith which works through love, that is to say, through faith and works. But [the idea] that faith can fulfill the function of a hand that lays hold on the righteousness which is in Christ, and can then apply it unto us for salvation, we know to be far from all Orthodoxy. For faith so understood would be possible in all, and so none could miss salvation, which is obviously false. But on the contrary, we rather believe that it is not the correlative of faith, but the faith which is in us, justifies through works, with Christ. But we regard works not as witnesses certifying our calling, but as being fruits in themselves, through which faith becomes efficacious, and as in themselves meriting, through the Divine promises {cf. 2 Corinthians 5:10} that each of the Faithful may receive what is done through his own body, whether it be good or bad.*

Decree 13, Source: <http://www.crivoice.org/creeddositheus.html>

- ¹⁶ Council of Trent: *Decrees on Justification*, Chapter IV

- ¹⁷ Sproul: *Faith Alone*, page 44

Other definitions from Protestant side:

But the doctrine of justification is this, that we are pronounced righteous and are saved solely by faith in Christ, and without works.

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4*, 1535, Luther's Works, Vol. 26, page 223

*The acceptance with which God receives us into his favour **as if we were righteous**.*

Calvin: *The Institutes of the Christian Religion* 3.11.2, page 605

Justification is a judicial act of God, in which He declares, on the basis of the righteousness of Jesus Christ, that all the claims of the law are satisfied with respect to the sinner.

Berkhof, L.: *Systematic Theology*, page 513

Louis Berkhof (1873 – 1957) was one of distinguished Reformed theologians. He taught at Calvin Theological Seminary from 1906 and served as its president from 1931 – 1944.

18 *Our justification comes from the grace of God*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1996

19 *This disposition, or preparation, is followed by Justification itself, which is not remission of sins merely, but also the sanctification and renewal of the inward man, through the voluntary reception of the grace, and of the gifts, whereby man of unjust becomes just [righteous], and of an enemy a friend, that so he may be an heir according to hope of life everlasting.*

Council of Trent: *Decrees on Justification*, Chapter VII

Justification is not only the remission of sins, but also the sanctification and renewal of the interior man.

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1989

20 *we are therefore said to be justified by faith, because faith is the beginning of human salvation, the foundation, and the root of all Justification; without which it is impossible to please God.*

Council of Trent: *Decrees on Justification*, Chapter VIII

21 *The Synod furthermore declares, that in adults, the beginning of the said Justification is to be derived from the prevenient grace of God, through Jesus Christ, that is to say, from His vocation, whereby, without any merits existing on their parts, they are called.*

Council of Trent: *Decrees on Justification*, Chapter V

Moved by the grace of the Holy Spirit and drawn by the Father, we believe in Jesus and confess: "You are the Christ, the Son of the living God."

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 424

Since the initiative belongs to God in the order of grace, no one can merit the initial grace of forgiveness and justification, at the beginning of conversion.

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 2010

22 *Justification takes place once for all. It is not repeated, neither is it a process; it is complete at once and for all time.*

Berkhof, L.: *Systematic Theology*, page 513

23 *God justifies not only by pardoning but by regenerating, he asks, whether he leaves those whom he justifies as they were by nature, making no change upon their vices? The answer is very easy: as Christ cannot be divided into parts, so the two things, justification and sanctification, which we perceive to be united together in him, are inseparable.*

Calvin: *The Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 3.11.6, page 609

24 Greek verbs have both aspect and tense – the former indicates what type of action the verb describes. There are three aspects: *completed*, *undefined* and *on-going* (or *continuous*).

The aspect of Greek present tense is either on-going or undefined (Mounce, W.D.: *Basics of Biblical Greek grammar- Second Edition*, 2003, page 129). It indicates on-going action like in John 10:14: *I am the good shepherd. I know my own and my own know me.* It may also indicate actions that happens regularly or repeatedly like the verb "to fall" in Matthew 17:15: *for often he falls into the fire.* In its undefined aspect, present tense may indicate non-continuous action that happens in the future: *"surely, I [Christ] am coming soon"* (Revelation 22:20) or even a non-continuous action that happens in the past: *The next day he [John the Baptist] saw Jesus coming toward him and said"* (John 1:29).

With reference to aspect, the present tense is internal (that is, it portrays the action from the inside of the event, without special regard for beginning or end), but it makes no comment as to fulfillment (or completion). The present tense's portrayal of an event "focuses on its development or progress and sees the occurrence in regard to its internal make-up, without beginning or end in view". It is sometimes called progressive. It "basically represents an activity as in process (or in progress)."

Wallace, D.B.: *The Basics of New Testament Syntax*, 2000, page 219

25 *The aorist indicates an undefined action usually occurring in the past.*

The aorist tense has often been mishandled by both scholars and preachers. Aorist verbs too frequently are said to denote once-for-all action when the text has no such intention.

Mounce, W.D.: *Basics of Biblical Greek grammar – Second Edition*, 2003, pages 198, 202

The aorist tense “presents an occurrence in summary, viewed as a whole from the outside, without regard for the internal make-up of the occurrence.” This contrasts with the present and imperfect, which portray the action as an outgoing process. It may be helpful to think of **the aorist as taking a snapshot of the action** while the imperfect (like the present) takes a motion picture, portraying the action as it unfolds.

Wallace, D.B.: *The Basics of New Testament Syntax*, 2000, page 239

Aorist verbs have undefined aspect - the writer or speaker does not tell us whether the action is completed or on-going. We need to look at the context to know it. Thus, an aorist verb may indicate once-for-all action as in Rom. 6:10: “he [Christ] **died to sin once for all**”. The phrase “once for all”, also found in Hebrews 7:27 and 9:12 (of which corresponding verbs are also aorist), tells us that the action is once for all. Aorist verb may indicate on-going action: “for God so **loved the world**” (John 3:16) and “**The grass withers, and the flowers fall**” (1 Peter 1:24).

²⁶ *The force of the perfect tense is simply that it describes an event that, completed in the past (we are speaking of the perfect indicative here), has results existing in the present time (i.e., in relation to the time of the speaker). Or, as Zerwick [Zerwick: *Biblical Greek*, page 96] puts it, the perfect tense is used for “indicating not the past action as such but the present ‘state of affairs’ resulting from the past action.”*

*BDF [Blass, F. and Debrunner, A. (translated and revised by Funk, R.W.): *A Greek Grammar of the New Testament and Other Early Christian Literature*, 1961] suggest that the perfect tense “combines in itself, so to speak, the present and the aorist in that it denotes the continuance of completed action”*

Wallace, D.B.: *Greek Grammar Beyond the Basics*, 1996, page 239

The Greek perfect is one of the more interesting tenses and is often used to express great theological truths. The Greek perfect describes an action that was brought to completion and whose effects are felt in the present. Because it describes a completed action, by implication the action described by the perfect verb normally occurred in the past.

Mounce, W.D.: *Basics of Biblical Greek Grammar - Second Edition*, 2003, page 225

²⁷ *But to return to the matter in hand! If your papist wants to make so much fuss about the word sola (alone) tell him this, “Dr. Martin Luther will have it so, and says that a papist and an ass are the same thing.” Sic volo, sic jubeo; sit pro ratione voluntas [I will it; I command it; my will is reason enough] is line 223 from the famous sixth satire of the Roman poet Juvenal (ca. a.d. 60-140), directed against the female sex. Luther used the quotation when he wanted to characterize the capricious unlimited power of the pope]. We are not going to be the pupils and disciples of the papists, but their masters and judges. For once, we too are going to be proud and brag with these blockheads; and as St. Paul boasts over against his mad raving saints [II Cor. 11:21ff.], so I shall boast over against these asses of mine. Are they doctors? So am I. Are they learned? So am I. Are they preachers? So am I. Are they theologians? So am I. Are they debaters? So am I. Are they philosophers? So am I. Are they dialecticians? So am I. Are they lecturers? So am I. Do they write books? So do I.*

Let this be the answer to your first question. And please give these asses no other and no further answer to their useless braying about the word sola than simply this, “Luther will have it so, and says that he is a doctor above all the doctors of the whole papacy.” It shall stay at that! Henceforth I shall simply hold them in contempt, and have them held in contempt, so long as they are the kind of people-I should say, asses-that they are.

Here, in Romans 3[:28], I knew very well that the word solum is not in the Greek or Latin text; the papists [Catholics] did not have to teach me that. It is a fact that these four letters s o l a are not there. And these blockheads stare at them like cows at a new gate. At the same time they do not see that it conveys the sense of the text; it belongs there if the translation is to be clear and vigorous. I wanted to speak German, not Latin or Greek, since it was German I had undertaken to speak in the translation. But it is the nature of our German language that in speaking of two things, one of which is affirmed and the other denied, we use the word solum (allein) along with the word nicht [not] or kein [no]. For example, we say, “The farmer brings allein grain and kein money”; “No, really I have now nicht money, but allein grain”; “I have allein eaten and nicht yet drunk”; “Did you allein write it, and nicht read it over?” There are innumerable cases of this kind in daily use.

Luther: *On Translating: an Open Letter*, 1530, Luther's Works, Vol. 35, pages 185 – 186, 187, 188 - 189

²⁸ *This is because Christ, the Son of God, who with the Father and the Spirit is hailed as 'alone holy,' loved the Church as his Bride, giving himself up for her so as to sanctify her; he joined her to himself as his body and endowed her with the gift of the Holy Spirit for the glory of God." The Church, then, is "the holy People of God," and her members are called "saints."*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 823

²⁹ *Justification is by faith alone, but not by faith that is alone. Saving faith is not a "lonely" faith, having no works following as a companion.*

Sproul, R.C.: *Faith Alone*, page 156

³⁰ *For since good works have the relation of the means to the end (Jn. 3:5, 16; Mt. 5:8); of the "way" to the goal (Eph. 2:10; Phil. 3:14); of the "sowing" to the harvest (Gal. 6:7, 8); of the "first fruits" to the mass (Rom. 8:23); of labor to the reward (Mt. 20:1); of the "contest" to the crown (2 Tim. 2:5; 4:8), everyone sees that **there is the highest and an indispensable necessity of good works for obtaining glory. It is so great that it cannot be reached without them (Heb. 12:14; Rev. 21:27).***

Turretin, F.: *Institutes of Elenctic Theology*, Vol. 2, page 705

Francis Turretin (1623 – 1687) was Swiss Italian Reformed theologian.

³¹ *Although not the ground of our acceptance, **good works are absolutely essential to salvation**, as the necessary consequences of a gracious state of soul and perpetual requirements of the divine law. Gal v. 22,23; Eph ii.10; John xiv.21*

Hodge, A.A.: *The Confession of Faith*, page 196

Archibald Alexander Hodge (1823 – 1886) was Reformed theologian. He was Principal of Princeton Seminary from 1878 to 1886, after his father, Charles Hodge (1797 to 1878) who held that position from 1851 to 1878.

³² *The Bible teaches clearly that the evidence of God's work in a life is the inevitable fruit of transformed behavior (1 John 3:10). Faith that does not result in righteous living is dead and cannot save (James 2:14-17).*

MacArthur, J.F.: *The Gospel according to Jesus, Revised and Expanded edition*, page 29

John F. MacArthur Jr. (born 1939) is the pastor-teacher of Grace Community Church, as well as an author, conference speaker, chancellor of The Master's University and Seminary, and featured teacher with the Grace to You media ministry.

³³ *But be sure you hear this carefully and precisely: He [Schreiner] says **right with God by faith alone, not attain heaven by faith alone**. Such faith always "works by love" and produces the "obedience of faith." And that obedience—imperfect as it is till the day we die—is not the "basis of justification, but ... a **necessary** evidence and fruit of justification.*

Piper, J.: Foreword of Schreiner, T.: *Faith Alone – the Doctrine of Justification*, page 11

John Piper (born in 1946) is founder and teacher of DesiringGod.org and chancellor of Bethlehem College & Seminary.

³⁴ *Free Grace theology is the view that 1) everlasting life is a free gift (which the Lord Jesus fully paid for by His death on the cross for our sins) which is received by faith alone in Christ alone, apart from works of any kind; 2) that assurance of one's eternal destiny is based solely on believing Jesus' promise to the believer and not at all on our works or on our feelings; and 3) that all people, believers and unbelievers, are accountable for their works, receive recompense for what they do in this life, and will be judged at the end of the age (in two separate judgments) to determine degrees of reward (believers) or degrees of torment (unbelievers) in the life to come, but not to determine their eternal destinies.*

Source: www.faithalone.org

³⁵ from *anti*, meaning against, and *nomos*, meaning Law. The term Antinomian was coined by Luther to describe what John Agricola (1494 – 1566) taught: Christians are not required to obey Law [Commandments] because they are saved by faith alone.

³⁶ *On the other hand, the subject of justification was discussed more cursorily, because it seemed of more consequence first to explain that the faith by which alone, through the mercy of God, we obtain free justification, is **not destitute of good works**;*

Calvin: *The Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 3.11.1, page 605

*Those who are justified by true faith **prove their justification by obedience and good works**, not by a bare and imaginary semblance of faith. In one word, he is not discussing the mode of justification, but requiring that the*

justification of believers shall be operative. And as **Paul contends that men are justified without the aid of works, so James will not allow any to be regarded as justified who are destitute of good works.**

Calvin: *The Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 3.17.2, page 680

37 Those with true faith will fail – and in some cases, fail pathetically and frequently – but a genuine believer will, as a pattern of life, be confessing sin and coming to the Father for forgiveness (1 John 1:9).

MacArthur, J.F.: *The Gospel according to Jesus, Revised and Expanded edition*, page 216

38 repentance not only **always** follows faith, but is produced by it.

Calvin: *The Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 3.3.1, page 497

True repentance never exists except in conjunction with faith, while, on the other hand, **wherever there is true faith, there is also real repentance** The two cannot be separated; they are simply complementary parts of the same process.

Berkhof, L.: *Systematic Theology*, page 487

39 Faith alone (not repentance and faith) is the sole condition for justification and eternal life.

Hodges, Z.C.: *Absolutely Free: A Biblical Reply to Lordship Salvation*, page 144

Zane. C. Hodges (1933 – 2008) was an American pastor, seminary professor, and Bible scholar.

40 All people—believers and unbelievers—are accountable for their works, receive recompense for what they do in this life, and will be judged at the end of the age to determine degrees of reward (believers) or degrees of torment (unbelievers) in the life to come, but not to determine their eternal destinies.

Source: www.faithalone.org

41 Philip Melanchthon (1497 – 1560) was a German Reformer, deputy of Luther, and the first Protestant systematic theologian.

42 If you [Philip Melanchthon] are a preacher of grace, then preach a true and not a fictitious grace; if grace is true, you must bear a true and not a fictitious sin. God does not save people who are only fictitious sinners. **Be a sinner and sin boldly, but believe and rejoice in Christ even more boldly**, for he is victorious over sin, death, and the world. As long as we are here [in this world] we have to sin. This life is not the dwelling place of righteousness, but, as Peter says, we look for new heavens and a new earth in which righteousness dwells. It is enough that by the riches of God's glory we have come to know the Lamb that takes away the sin of the world. **No sin will separate us from the Lamb, even though we commit fornication and murder a thousand times a day. Do you think that the purchase price that was paid for the redemption of our sins by so great a Lamb is too small? Pray boldly—you too are a mighty sinner.**

Luther: *Letter to Philip Melanchthon*, August 1, 1521, Luther's Works, Vol. 48, page 281-282

43 With our gaze fastened firmly to Him we must declare with assurance that He is our Righteousness and Life and care nothing about the threats and terrors of the Law, sin, death, wrath, and the judgment of God. For the Christ on whom our gaze is fixed, in whom we exist, and who also lives in us, is the Victor and the Lord over the Law, sin, death, and every evil.

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4*, 1535, Luther's Works, Vol. 26, page 166-167

And although **sin still clings to our flesh and we still fall every day**, still grace is more abundant and more powerful than sin. For the mercy and the truth of the Lord reign over us forever. Therefore sin is unable to frighten us or to make us doubt the grace of God that is in us. Christ, that mighty giant, has abolished the Law, condemned sin, and destroyed death and every evil. So long as He is at the right hand of God interceding for us, we cannot have any doubts about the grace of God toward us.

ibid, page 378

44 Therefore we conclude with Paul that we are justified solely by faith in Christ, without the Law and works. But after a man is justified by faith, now possesses Christ by faith, and knows that He is his righteousness and life, he will certainly not be idle but, like a sound tree, will bear good fruit (Matt. 7:17). For the believer has the Holy Spirit; and where He is, He does not permit a man to be idle but drives him to all the exercises of devotion, to the love of God, to patience in affliction, to prayer, to thanksgiving, and to the practice of love toward all men.

Therefore we, too, say that **faith without works is worthless and useless**. The papists [Catholics] and the fanatics take this to mean that faith without works does not justify, or that if faith does not have works, it is of no avail,

no matter how true it is. That is false. But faith without works—that is, a fantastic idea and mere vanity and a dream of the heart—is a false faith and does not justify.

ibid, page 154-155

⁴⁵ *It is true that He [God] does not impute it [sin], but to whom and on what account? Not to the hardhearted and smug but to those who repent and who by faith take hold of Christ the Propitiator, on whose account sins are forgiven them and the remnants of sin are not imputed to them.*

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 5-6*, 1535, Luther's Works, Vol. 27, page 75

⁴⁶ *Works are necessary to salvation, but they do not cause salvation, because faith alone gives life. On account of the hypocrites we must say that good works are necessary to salvation. It is necessary to work. Nevertheless, it does not follow that works save on that account, unless we understand necessity very clearly as the necessity that there must be an inward and outward salvation or righteousness. Works save outwardly, that is, they show evidence that we are righteous and that there is faith in a man which saves inwardly, as Paul says, "Man believes with his heart and so is justified, and he confesses with his lips and so is saved" [Rom. 10:10]. Outward salvation shows faith to be present, just as fruit shows a tree to be good.*

Luther: *The Disputation Concerning Justification*, 1536, Luther's Works, Vol. 34, page 165

⁴⁷ *Christ did not earn only gratia, "grace," for us, but also donum, "the gift of the Holy Spirit," so that we might have not only forgiveness of, but also cessation of, sin. Now he who does not abstain from sin, but persists in his evil life, must have a different Christ, that of the Antinomians; the real Christ is not there, even if all the angels would cry, "Christi Christi" He must be damned with this, his new Christ.*

Luther: *on the Councils and the Church*, 1539, Luther's Works, Vol. 41, page 114

⁴⁸ *When God touches man's heart through the illumination of the Holy Spirit, man himself is not inactive while receiving that inspiration, since he could reject it; and yet, without God's grace, he cannot by his own free will move himself toward justice in God's sight.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1993

⁴⁹ *The name Arminian came from Dutch Protestant theologian Jacob Harmensen, in Latin Jacobus Arminius (1560 – 1609). For more information: <http://evangelicalarminians.org>.*

⁵⁰ *So it remains true that grace is not efficacious because free will consents, but conversely the free will consents because grace efficaciously removes it to the willing and performance of a good act.*

Catholic Encyclopedia: *Controversies on Grace: Thomism*

For it is not the will which by its free consent determines the power of grace, but conversely it is grace which makes the free good act possible, prepares for it and co-operates in its execution.

Catholic Encyclopedia: *Controversies on Grace: Molinism*

⁵¹ *Augustine: Rebuke and Grace 8.17, in Nicene and Post Nicene Fathers, Vol. 5, page 478*

⁵² *Augustine: Sermon 169.13, The Works of Saint Augustine: sermons III/5 (148-183), page 231*

⁵³ *On the other hand in relation to God, or in matters pertaining to salvation or damnation, a man has no free choice, but is a captive, subject and slave either of the will of God or the will of Satan [devil].*

Luther: *The Bondage of the Will*, Luther's Works, 1525, Vol. 33, page 70

⁵⁴ *Thus the human will is placed between the two like a beast of burden. If God rides it, it wills and goes where God wills, as the psalm says: "I am become as a beast [before thee] and I am always with thee" [Psalms 73:22]. If Satan rides it, it wills and goes where Satan wills; nor can it choose to run to either of the two riders or to seek him out, but the riders themselves contend for the possession and control of it....*

For if God is in us, Satan is absent, and only a good-will is present; if God is absent, Satan is present, and only an evil-will is in us.

ibid, pages 65 – 66, 112

⁵⁵ *In just the same way (our answer continues), before man is changed into a new creature of the Kingdom of the Spirit, he does nothing and attempts nothing to prepare himself for this renewal and this Kingdom, and when he has been recreated he does nothing and attempts nothing toward remaining in this Kingdom, but the Spirit alone does both of these things in us, recreating us without us and preserving us without our help in our recreated state, as also James says: "Of his own will he brought us forth by the word of his power, that we might be a beginning of his creature" [James 1:18]—speaking of the renewed creature.*

ibid, page 243

⁵⁶ Thesis 39 of Luther: *Disputation Against Scholastic Theology*, 1517, Luther's Works Vol. 31, page 11.

⁵⁷ *But the question is asked whether freedom to choose good or evil does not naturally reside in man. He [Augustine] replies: "It must be acknowledged that we have free choice to do both evil and good. But in doing evil each one is free of righteousness and the slave of sin, while in doing good, no one can be free, unless he has first been set free by the Son of God [Augustine: Rebuke and Grace 1.2, NPNF 5:472]. So people are freed from evil by the grace of God alone. Without this they do no good at all, whether by thinking, or by willing and loving, or by acting.*

Calvin: *The Bondage and Liberation of the Will*, page 130,

NPNF is Nicene and Post Nicene Fathers is collection of (English translation of) the works of early Christians (Church Fathers) who live during and after Council of Nicea in 325 AD, available @ at www.ccel.org.

⁵⁸ *Yet someone will say that [Augustine] implies that once that grace has been received the first time, we cooperate with God. Of course, since the will which has now been made good through the power of the Holy Spirit is ours, and we act by means of it after previously being acted on by God, it is not at all surprising if part of the action is ascribed to us. Accordingly, when he [Augustine] finishes, he says that "God will repay the faithful both with good for evil, that is, with grace in return for unrighteousness, and with good for good, that is, with grace in return for grace." [Augustine: Grace and Free Choice 23.45, NPNF 5:464]*

Calvin: *The Bondage and Liberation of the Will*, page 123

The act of grace which regenerates, operating within the spontaneous energies of the soul and changing their character, can neither be co-operated with nor resisted. But the instant the soul is regenerated it begins to co-operate with and sometimes, alas! also to resist subsequent gracious influences prevenient and co-operative.

Hodge, A.A.: *Outlines of Theology*, page 448-449

Regeneration, then, is to be conceived monergistically. God alone works, and the sinner has no part in it whatsoever. This, of course, does not mean, that man does not co-operate in later stages of the work of redemption. It is quite evident from Scripture that he does.

Berkhof, L.: *Systematic Theology*, page 473

There is much confusion about the debate between monergism and synergism. When Augustinianism is defined as monergistic, one must remember that it is monergistic with respect to the beginning of salvation, not to the whole process. Augustinianism does not reject all synergism, but does reject a synergism that is all synergism.

Sproul: *Willing to Believe: The Controversy over Free Will*, pages 73

⁵⁹ *the alone formal cause is the justice of God, not that whereby He Himself is just [righteous], but that whereby He maketh us just [righteous], that, to wit, with which we being endowed by Him, are renewed in the spirit of our mind, and we are not only reputed, but are truly called, and are, just [righteous], receiving justice within us, each one according to his own measure, which the Holy Ghost distributes to every one as He wills, and according to each one's proper disposition and co-operation.*

Council of Trent: *Decrees on Justification*, Chapter VII

⁶⁰ *The sinner is declared righteous in view of the fact that the righteousness of Christ is imputed to him.*

Berkhof, L.: *Systematic Theology*, page 517

First, justification is forensic rather than transformative, denoting a change in status rather than a change in nature. Second, justification is clearly distinguished from sanctification. Justification refers to the declaration that one stands in the right before God, while sanctification denotes the ongoing renewal and transformation in one's life. Third, justification denotes alien righteousness, which means that Christ's righteousness is imputed to the believer. Believers aren't righteous because of a righteousness inherent to them.

Schreiner, T.R.: *Faith Alone – the Doctrine of Justification*, page 39

⁶¹ *Justification is at the same time the acceptance of God's righteousness through faith in Jesus Christ. Righteousness (or 'justice') here means the rectitude of divine love. With justification, faith, hope and charity are poured into our hearts, and obedience to divine will is granted us.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1991

62 *We, on the other hand, teach and comfort an afflicted sinner this way: “Brother, it is impossible for you to become so righteous in this life that your body is as clear and spotless as the sun.*

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4*, 1535, Luther’s Works, Vol. 26, page 233

63 *On account of this faith in Christ God does not see the sin that still remains in me. For so long as I go on living in the flesh, there is certainly sin in me. But meanwhile Christ protects me under the shadow of His wings and spreads over me the wide heaven of the forgiveness of sins, under which I live in safety. This prevents God from seeing the sins that still cling to my flesh. My flesh distrusts God, is angry with Him, does not rejoice in Him, etc. But God overlooks these sins, and in His sight they are as though they were not sins. This is accomplished by imputation on account of the faith by which I begin to take hold of Christ; and on His account God reckons imperfect righteousness as perfect righteousness and sin as not sin, even though it really is sin.*

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4*, 1535, Luther’s Works, Vol. 26, pages 231-232

64 Catechism of the Catholic Church # 161

65 Luther: *The Disputation concerning justification*, 1536, Luther’s Works, Vol. 34, page 184

66 *The merit of man before God in the Christian life arises from the fact that God has freely chosen to associate man with the work of his grace.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 2008

67 *Moved by the Holy Spirit and by charity, we can then merit for ourselves and for others the graces needed for our sanctification, for the increase of grace and charity, and for the attainment of eternal life.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 2010

68 *Thus we sin even when we do good, unless God through Christ covers this imperfection and does not impute it to us. Thus it becomes a venial sin, though the mercy of God, who does not impute it for the sake of faith and the plea on behalf of this imperfection for the sake of Christ. Therefore, he who thinks that he might be regarded as righteous because of his works is very foolish, since if they were offered as a sacrifice to the judgment of God, they still would be found to be sins. . . . Therefore iniquity will be found in his righteousness, that is, even his good works will be unrighteous and sinful. This iniquity will not be found in believers and those who cry to Him, because Christ has brought them aid from the fullness of his purity and has hidden the imperfection of theirs.*

Luther: *Lectures on Romans*, 1515 – 1516, Luther’s Works, Vol. 25, pages 276-277

69 *All we assign to man is that, by his impurity he pollutes and contaminates the very works which were good. The most perfect thing which proceeds from man is always polluted by some stain. Should the Lords therefore bring to judgment the best of human works, he would indeed behold his own righteousness in them; but he would also behold man’s dishonour and disgrace.*

Calvin, *The Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 3.15.3, page 658

70 Berkhof, L.: *Systematic Theology*, page 523

71 Luther: *A Commentary of St. Paul’s Epistle to the Galatians*, 1538, page 106 (available at www.ccel.org)

72 Catechism of the Catholic Church # 2019

73 *“Christ has done enough for me. He is just. He is my defense. He has died for me. He has made His righteousness my righteousness, and my sin His sin. If He has made my sin to be His sin, then I do not have it, and I am free. If He has made His righteousness my righteousness, then I am righteous now with the same righteousness as He.*

Luther: *Lectures on Romans*, 1515 – 1516, Luther’s Works, Vol. 25, page 188

Therefore, my dear Friar [George Spenlein, Augustinian friar at Wittenberg Monastery], learn Christ and him crucified. Learn to praise him and, despairing of yourself, say, “Lord Jesus, you are my righteousness, just as I am your sin. You have taken upon yourself what is mine and have given to me what is yours. You have taken upon yourself what you were not and have given to me what I was not.”

Luther: *Letter to George Spenlein*, 8 Apr 1516, Luther’s Works, Vol. 48, page 12

His [Christ] righteousness is yours; your sin is His.

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4*, 1535, Luther’s Works, Vol. 26, page 233

For the Son of God, though spotlessly pure, took upon him the disgrace and ignominy of our iniquities, and in return clothed us with his purity.

Calvin: *The Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 2.16.6, page 429

74 *Is not this a beautiful, glorious exchange, by which Christ, who is wholly innocent and holy, not only takes upon himself another's sin, that is, my sin and guilt, but also clothes and adorns me, who am nothing but sin, with his own innocence and purity? And then besides dies the shameful death of the Cross for the sake of my sins, through which I have deserved death and condemnation, and grants to me his righteousness, in order that I may live with him eternally in glorious and unspeakable joy. Through this blessed exchange, in which Christ changes places with us (something the heart can grasp only in faith), and through nothing else, are we freed from sin and death and given his righteousness and life as our own.*

Luther: *Sermon on Matthew 3:13-17 at the Baptism of Bernhard von Anhalt*, 2 Apr 1540, Luther's Works, Vol. 51, page 316

75 *Hence it follows, that we can confidently assure ourselves, that eternal life, of which he himself is the heir, is ours, and that the kingdom of heaven, into which he has entered, can no more be taken from us than from him; on the other hand, that we cannot be condemned for our sins, from the guilt of which he absolves us, seeing he has been pleased that these should be imputed to himself as if they were his own. This is the wondrous exchange made by his boundless goodness.*

Calvin, *The Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 4.17.2, page 1124

76 *Moved by grace, man turns toward God and away from sin, thus accepting forgiveness and righteousness from on high.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1989, # 2018

77 *we are in a divine theology, where we hear the Gospel that Christ died for us and that when we believe this we are reckoned as righteous, even though sins, and great ones at that, still remain in us.*

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4*, 1535, Luther's Works, Vol. 26, page 234

78 *Thus a Christian man is righteous and a sinner at the same time, holy and profane, an enemy of God and a child of God.*

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4*, 1535, Luther's Works, Vol. 26, page 232

Therefore, whoever is justified is still a sinner; and yet he is considered fully and perfectly righteous by God who pardons and is merciful.

Luther: *The Disputation concerning Justification*, 1536, Luther's Works, Vol. 34, page 152-153

Christians are righteous and sinners at the same time – righteous because our sin is covered by the perfect righteousness of Christ and sinful because in and of ourselves we are still prone to follow the cravings of the flesh.

McKim, D.K., editor: *The Westminster Handbook to Reformed Theology*, page 202

79 *Justification has been merited for us by the Passion of Christ who offered himself on the cross as a living victim, holy and pleasing to God, and whose blood has become the instrument of atonement for the sins of all men.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1992

but the meritorious cause is His most beloved only-begotten, our Lord Jesus Christ, who, when we were enemies, for the exceeding charity wherewith he loved us, merited Justification for us by His most holy Passion on the wood of the cross, and made satisfaction for us unto God the Father.

Council of Trent: *Decrees on Justification*, Chapter VII

80 *Sanctifying grace is an habitual gift, a stable and supernatural disposition that perfects the soul itself to enable it to live with God, to act by his love. Habitual grace, the permanent disposition to live and act in keeping with God's call, is distinguished from actual graces which refer to God's interventions, whether at the beginning of conversion or in the course of the work of sanctification.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 2000

81 *Christ, Head of the Church, manifests what his Body contains and radiates in the sacraments: "the hope of glory" (Col. 1:27)*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 568

The saving work of his holy and sanctifying humanity is the sacrament of salvation, which is revealed and active in the Church's sacraments (which the Eastern Churches also call "the holy mysteries").

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 774

- 82 *God has bound salvation to the sacrament of Baptism, but he himself is not bound by his sacraments.*
Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1257
- 83 Reeves, M.: foreword of Wellum: *Christ Alone – the Uniqueness of Jesus as Savior*, page 13.
Michael Reeves is President and Professor of Theology at [Union School of Theology \(ust.ac.uk\)](http://ust.ac.uk)
- 84 Wellum, S.J.: *Christ Alone – the Uniqueness of Jesus as Savior*, page 262.
Stephen J. Wellum (born 1964) is professor of Christian theology at The Southern Baptist Theological Seminary and editor of the *Southern Baptist Journal of Theology*.
- 85 Mercy seat (or place of atonement) is the gold lid cover of the Ark of the Covenant with two cherubs at the two ends. The Hebrew word is כַּפֹּרֶת (Strong H3727), is related to כָּפַר (Strong H3725), meaning atonement or reconciliation and verb כָּפַר (Strong H3722), meaning to atone or to reconcile or to cover over. In Greek it is ἱλαστήριον (Strong G2435) which appears in Heb. 9:5.
- 86 Hebrew Azazel (אֲזַזֵּל, Strong H5799) from ez (עֵז, Strong H5795), meaning goat and verb azal (אָזַל, Strong H235), meaning to go away.
- 87 *Jesus did not experience reprobation as if he himself had sinned. But in the redeeming love that always united him to the Father, he assumed us in the state of our waywardness of sin, to the point that he could say in our name from the cross: “My God, my God, why have you forsaken me?” Having thus established him in solidarity with us sinners, God “did not spare his own Son but gave him up for us all,” so that we might be “reconciled to God by the death of his Son.”*
Catechism of the Catholic Church # 603
- 88 *The liturgy of the Church, however, sees in the priesthood of Aaron and the service of the Levites, as in the institution of the seventy elders, a prefiguring of the ordained ministry of the New Covenant.*
Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1541
- 89 *For a sin to be mortal, three conditions must together be met: “Mortal sin is sin whose object is grave matter and which is also committed with full knowledge and deliberate consent.” Grave matter is specified by the Ten Commandments.*
Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1857-1858
- 90 *Therefore it is a pernicious error when the sophists distinguish among sins on the basis of the substance of the deed rather than on the basis of the persons. A believer’s sin is the same sin and sin just as great as that of the unbeliever. To the believer, however, it is forgiven and not imputed, while to the unbeliever it is retained and imputed. To the former it is venial; to the latter it is mortal. This is not because of a difference between the sins, as though the believer’s sin were smaller and the unbeliever’s larger, but because of a difference between the persons.*
Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 5-6*, 1535, Luther’s Works, Vol. 27, page 76
- 91 *What, then, is the meaning of the Apostle? He denies that sins are mortal, which, though worthy of death, are yet not thus punished by God. He therefore does not estimate sins in themselves, but forms a judgment of them according to the paternal kindness of God, which pardons the guilt, where yet the fault is. In short, God does not give over to death those whom he has restored to life, though it depends not on them that they are not alienated from life.*
Calvin: *Commentaries on the Catholic Epistles*, page 238
- 92 *Rome distinguishes between mortal and venial sin. Venial sin is real sin but is less serious. Mortal sin is called mortal because it kills the justifying grace in the soul. Mortal sin destroys grace but not faith. A person can retain faith and still not justified.*
Sproul, R.C.: *Grace Unknown*, page 63
- 93 Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1472
- 94 Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1473
- 95 There are partial and plenary indulgences correspond to remission of part or total temporal punishment.
- 96 Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1471
- 97 Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1475 - 1479
- 98 Augustine: *On the Catechism of the Uninstructed* 26:50.
- 99 *Justification is conferred in Baptism, the sacrament of faith.*
Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1992
- 100 *The Lord himself affirms that Baptism is necessary for salvation [John 3:5] He also commands his disciples to proclaim the Gospel to all nations and to baptize them [Matthew 28:19-20]. Baptism is necessary for salvation*

for those to whom the Gospel has been proclaimed and who have had the possibility of asking for this sacrament {Mark 16:16}. The Church does not know of any means other than Baptism that assures entry into eternal beatitude; this is why she takes care not to neglect the mission she has received from the Lord to see that all who can be baptized are 'reborn of water and the Spirit'. God has bound salvation to the sacrament of Baptism, but he himself is not bound by his sacraments.

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1257

¹⁰¹ *Through Baptism we are freed from sin and reborn as sons of God.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1213

Baptism not only purifies from all sins, but also makes the neophyte 'a new creature', an adopted son of God, who has become a 'partaker of the divine nature, [2 Corinthians 5:17, 2 Peter 1:4] member of Christ and co-heir with him [Rom. 8:17, 1 Cor. 6:15, 12:17] and the temple of the Holy Spirit [1 Cor. 6:19].

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1265

¹⁰² *The significance of baptism is a blessed dying unto sin and a resurrection in the grace of God, so that the old man, conceived and born in sin, is there drowned, and a new man, born in grace, comes forth and rises. Thus St. Paul, in Titus 3[:5], calls baptism a "washing of regeneration," since in this washing a person is born again and made new. As Christ also says, in John 3[:3, 5], "Unless you are born again of water and the Spirit (of grace), you may not enter into the kingdom of heaven." For just as a child is drawn out of his mother's womb and is born, and through this fleshly birth is a sinful person and a child of wrath [Eph. 2:3], so one is drawn out of baptism and is born spiritually. Through this spiritual birth he is a child of grace and a justified person. Therefore sins are drowned in baptism, and in place of sin, righteousness comes forth.*

Luther: *The Holy and Blessed Sacrament of Baptism*, 1519, Luther's Works, Vol. 35, page 30

¹⁰³ *These every person must know. In the first place, note the command of God, which is very stern when he says: "He who believes and is baptized will be saved; but he who does not believe will be condemned" (Mark 16:16). This is a strict command; **if a person wants to be saved, let him be baptized**; otherwise he is in God's disfavor.*

Luther: *Ten Sermons on the Catechism: on Baptism*, 1528, Luther's Works Vol. 51, page 182-183

¹⁰⁴ *By the washing of regeneration I have no doubt that he alludes, at least, to baptism, and even I will not object to have this passage expounded as relating to baptism; not that salvation is contained in the outward symbol of water, but because baptism tells to us the salvation obtained by Christ.*

Now the Apostles are wont to draw an argument from the Sacraments, to prove that which us there exhibited under a figure, because it ought to be held by believers as a settled principle, that God does not sport with us by unmeaning figures, but inwardly accomplishes by his power what he exhibits by the outward sign; and therefore, baptism is fitly and truly said to be "the washing of regeneration".

Calvin: *Commentary on Timothy, Titus, Philemon*, page 276

¹⁰⁵ *By Baptism all sins are forgiven, original sin and all personal sins, as well as all punishment for sin.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1263

¹⁰⁶ *The Most Holy Trinity gives the baptized sanctifying grace, the grace of justification*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1266

¹⁰⁷ *From this it follows, to be sure, that when someone comes forth out of baptism, he is truly pure, without sin, and wholly guiltless.*

Luther: *The Holy and Blessed Sacrament of Baptism*, 1519, Luther's Works, Vol. 35, page 32

¹⁰⁸ *Nor is it to be supposed that baptism is bestowed only with reference to the past, so that, in regard to new lapses into which we fall after baptism, we must seek new remedies of expiation in other so-called sacraments, just as if the power of baptism had become obsolete. We ought to consider that **at whatever time we are baptised, we are washed and purified once for the whole of life**. Wherefore, as often as we fall, we must recall the remembrance of our baptism, and thus fortify our minds, so as to feel certain and secure of the remission of sins. For though, when once administered, it seems to have passed, it is not abolished by subsequent sins.*

Calvin: *The Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 4.15.3, page 1080

¹⁰⁹ *All the universities have taught in this manner and the books of these universities are full of this idea that baptism removes original sin. Therefore, no sin at all remains in the baptized. But sins which men do after baptism do not extend to the blood of Christ, but actual sins are characteristic of human nature and we ought to remove them and we ought to make satisfaction for them. Original sin has been destroyed in baptism. Therefore, it is necessary*

that we make satisfaction for actual sins. This is a popish doctrine and an invention of those who share his opinion that many ways of reconciling God have been discovered. We see that this argument is the fountain and source of all monasteries, masses, pilgrimages, invocation of the saints, and similar devices by which men try to make satisfaction for sins. We, however, declare with Augustine, who alone preserved this teaching for us, that original sin is removed not so that it does not exist, but so that it is not imputed.

Luther: *The Disputation Concerning Justification*, 1536, Luther's Works, Vol. 34, page 180

- ¹¹⁰ *It is now clear how false the doctrine is which some long ago taught, and others still persist in, that by baptism we are exempted and set free from original sin, and from the corruption which was propagated by Adam to all his posterity, and that we are restored to the same righteousness and purity of nature which Adam would have had if he had maintained the integrity in which he was created.*

Calvin: *The Institutes of the Christian Religion* 4.15.10, pages 1083-1084

- ¹¹¹ Luther and Calvin lumped together guilt of Original Sin and its effect or concupiscence. The Catholic Church, on the other hand, distinguishes between the guilt of Original Sin, which is removed by Baptism and its effect or concupiscence, which remains with Baptized persons.

If anyone denies that by the grace of our Lord Jesus Christ, which is conferred in baptism, the guilt of original sin is remitted, or even asserts that the whole of that which has the true and proper nature of sin is not taken away, but says that it is only touched in person or is not imputed, let him be anathema. But this holy Synod confesses and perceives that there remains in the baptized concupiscence of an inclination, although this is left to be wrestled with, it cannot harm those who do not consent, but manfully resist by the grace of Jesus Christ.

Council of Trent: Canon 5 of the Decrees on Original Sin

- ¹¹² *The grace of Christ is the gratuitous gift that God makes to us of his own life, infused by the Holy Spirit into our soul to heal it of sin and to sanctify it. It is the sanctifying or deifying grace received in Baptism. It is in us the source of the work of sanctification.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1999

- ¹¹³ *All who die in God's grace and friendship, but still imperfectly purified, are indeed assured of their eternal salvation; but after death they undergo purification, so as to achieve the holiness necessary to enter the joy of heaven. The Church gives the name Purgatory to this final purification of the elect, which is entirely different from the punishment of the damned.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1030-31

- ¹¹⁴ *But because He took upon Himself our sins, not by compulsion but of His own free will, **it was right for Him to bear the punishment and the wrath of God**—not for His own Person, which was righteous and invincible and therefore could not become guilty, but for our person.*

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4*, 1535, Luther's Works, Vol. 26, page 284

- ¹¹⁵ ***He sent His Son into the world, heaped all the sins of all men upon Him**, and said to Him: "Be Peter the denier; Paul the persecutor, blasphemer, and assaulter; David the adulterer; the sinner who ate the apple in Paradise; the thief on the cross. In short, be the person of all men, the one who has committed the sins of all men. And see to it that You pay and make satisfaction for them." Now the Law comes and says: "I find Him a sinner, who takes upon Himself the sins of all men. I do not see any other sins than those in Him. Therefore let Him die on the cross!" And so it attacks Him and kills Him. By this deed the whole world is purged and expiated from all sins, and thus it is set free from death and from every evil.*

Luther: *Lectures on Galatians 1-4*, 1535, Luther's Works, Vol. 26, pages 280

*You truly have Him [Christ] only when you believe that this altogether pure and innocent Person has been granted to you by the Father as your High Priest and Redeemer, yes, as your Slave. **Putting off His innocence and holiness and putting on your sinful person**, He bore your sin, death, and curse; He became a sacrifice and a curse for you, in order thus to set you free from the curse of the Law.*

ibid, page 288

- ¹¹⁶ *The Church, following the apostles, teaches that Christ died for all men without exception: "There is not, never has been, and never will be a single human being for whom Christ did not suffer.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 605

- ¹¹⁷ *The second argument is that "God desires all men to be saved" (1 Tim. 2:4), and He gave His Son for us men and created man for eternal life. Likewise: All things exist for man, and he himself exists for God that he may enjoy*

Him, etc. These points and others like them can be refuted as easily as the first one. For these verses must always be understood as pertaining to the elect only, as the apostle says in 2 Tim. 2:10 "everything for the sake of the elect." For in an absolute sense Christ did not die for all, because He says: "This is My blood which is poured out for you" and "for many"—He does not say: for all—"for the forgiveness of sins" (Mark 14:24; Matt. 26:28).

Luther: Lectures on Romans, 1515 – 1516, Luther's Works, Vol. 25, pages 375-376

- ¹¹⁸ *Each man receives his eternal retribution in his immortal soul at the very moment of his death, in a particular judgment that refers his life to Christ: either entrance into the blessedness of heaven—through a purification or immediately, —or immediate and everlasting damnation.*

Catechism of the Catholic Church # 1022

- ¹¹⁹ *a man will be justified by faith when, excluded from the righteousness of works, he by faith lays hold of the righteousness of Christ, and clothed in it appears in the sight of God not as a sinner, but as righteous.*

Calvin: *The Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 3.11.2, page 605